

Counting Drone Strike Deaths



COLUMBIA LAW SCHOOL

HUMAN RIGHTS CLINIC

October 2012

Dataset for Pakistan 2011

The following is a strike-by-strike comparison of the reported casualty counts of three media tracking organizations – the Bureau of Investigative Journalism (BIJ), the New America Foundation (NAF), and the Long War Journal (LWJ) – together with our own independent count based on their sources. Our methodology is discussed in detail in our accompanying report, available online [here](#) at the Human Rights Institute of Columbia Law School site.

The sources relied on by each organization for each strike are listed in footnotes or in text. Hyperlinks to these sources are available on each organization’s website. In the case of the New America Foundation, the sources are listed in a PDF document which is hyperlinked on their website. Under each strike we have listed the casualty figures provided by each of the three organizations. We have also noted the “range of reported dead” which includes the lowest and highest reported casualty figures without any adjustment. Our own assessment of the reported number of dead is listed under “conclusion”. This may differ from the “range of reported dead”, for example in cases where some of the cited reports are outdated.

Our basic findings for 2011 are as follows:

	Total reported killed	Militants reported killed	Civilians reported killed	“Unknowns” reported killed
Our Count	456 - 661	330 - 575	72 - 155	n/a
BIJ	473 - 669	n/a	68 - 157	n/a
NAF	366 - 599	331 - 524	3 - 9	32 – 66
LWJ	438 - 478	421 - 475	3 - 38	n/a

1. January 1 2011 (2 strikes)

Mandi Khel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly targeted a vehicle and a house. A second strike later targeted rescuers apparently trying to collect the bodies. We count the two strikes together, and as occurring in Mandi Khel (although some sources place the second strike in Ghoreski, see below). Reports

suggest that the individuals killed may have been affiliated with Hafiz Gul Bahadar.¹ There are no reports that any of those killed were civilians. Most of the reports cite anonymous Pakistani officials for the death count and the identification of those killed as militants. The BBC noted: “The death toll cannot be independently confirmed and it is not clear whether all those killed were militants.” An on the ground investigation by the Associated Press (AP) states that 14 Taliban militants were killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 17 sources for this strike,² stating that 8-9 people were killed in the first strike, and 5-6 people in the second strike, giving a total of 13-15 people. The upper figure of 6 in the second strike is based on the Bureau’s own primary investigation in Waziristan. The Bureau’s researchers reported that 6 rescuers were killed.

The New America Foundation cites 8 of the sources listed by the Bureau,³ stating that 7-9 militants were killed in the first strike, and 4-5 militants were killed in the second strike. New America’s sources do not include AP’s later independent investigation. New America lists the location of the second strike as Ghoreski, but it also refers to the strike as targeting rescuers.

The Long War Journal lists the strike in Ghoreski as a separate strike. Citing a single source, Dawn newspaper (Pakistan), the Journal states that 7 militants were killed. The Journal counts 4 as killed in Ghoreski, but appears to treat them as distinct from the follow up attacks in Mandi Khel.⁴

Range of reported dead: 11-14 (8-9 first strike, 5-6 second strike)⁵ total

BIJ: 13-15 total (additional number coming from Bureau’s own researchers)

NAF: 11-14 militants dead

LWJ: 7 militants dead

Sources: Anonymous officials, AP investigation, Bureau investigation

Conclusion: 14-15 total killed. Strong identification of 14 Taliban killed, official claims of 11-14 militant deaths corroborated by AP investigation confirming 14 Taliban deaths. Medium identification of 0-1 further militants killed.

¹ The following media reports make this suggestion: Express Tribune/AFP; LA Times; Pakistan Observer; Al Jazeera.

² In the BIJ’s log, these are counted as two strikes, OB182 and OB183. The sources are: Geo TV (15 killed including Ghoreski strike); Express Tribune/AFP (7 + 4 militants killed); Dawn (7+4 militants killed); Dawn (9+5 people killed); LA Times (19 suspected militants killed in all strikes on this day); CNN (17 suspected militants killed in all strikes on this day); Pakistan Observer (14 people killed in all strikes on this day); BBC (15 people killed in all strikes on this day); The Nation (6+5 people killed); AP/ABC (9+5 people killed); Al Jazeera (9+5 people killed); Long War Journal; OpEd News (20 people killed in all strikes on this day); Al Jazeera (at least 15 people killed in all strikes on this day); Prison Planet Forum (9+5 people killed, citing AP); Jang (Urdu language); AP (14 Taliban militants killed).

³ Geo TV (as above); Express Tribune/AFP (as above); BBC (as above); AP (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); CNN (as above); LA Times (as above); Dawn/AFP (as above).

⁴ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 times in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, January 1, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_strike_15.php.

⁵ No source gives a total of less than 11 dead; the one source giving a figure of 6 for the first strike, The Nation, gives a figure of 5 for the second strike.

2. January 1 2011

Ghoreski, North Waziristan

Several sources describe the strike in Ghoreski as a follow up to the Mandi Khel strike, as noted above (Entry 1), but other sources describe the strike as distinct – a third strike, with the first two occurring in Mandi Khel. Each of the meta-studies comes to different conclusions about the number of strikes and where they occurred, making comparison of their figures difficult. The Bureau states that 4 strikes occurred on January 1: the first two in Mandi Khel; the third in Datta Khel; and the fourth in Boya. As there is no entry for Ghoreski but every strike is covered, we count the Bureau's Datta Khel strike here. New America lists three strikes, and some sources appear to treat the Ghoreski strike as a follow up to the Mandi Khel strike. As we have counted New America's numbers for Ghoreski under the previous entry, we do not re-count them here. The Long War Journal states that 3 strikes occurred: the first in Mandi Khel; the second in Ghoreski; and the third in Datta Khel. We count the Long War Journal's numbers for the Ghoreski strike here since it appears to have treated it as a separate strike, rather than a follow up strike in Mandi Khel.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 7 sources⁶ and states that 4-5 people were killed. The Long War Journal cites Geo TV and states that 4 militants were killed.⁷

Range of reported dead: 4-5

BIJ: 4-5 total

NAF: 0

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-5 militants killed. No further identifying information is provided, and the only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials. New America failed to count one strike that occurred on this day. While it is not clear due to the confused reporting of the strikes, we treat the missed strike as this one.

3. January 1 2011

Boya, Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This strike is treated as the fourth strike of the day by the Bureau, and the third strike of the day by New America and the Long War Journal. It reportedly targeted a vehicle. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists the same sources as for the first strikes, and states that 4 people

⁶ Geo TV (4 people killed); AFP/Express Tribune (4 militants killed); CNN (does not count a Datta Khel or Ghoreski strike); Pak Observer (4 people killed in Datta Khel, 5 people killed in Ghoreski); The Nation (4 people killed); Truth Dive (11 suspected militants killed in 3 strikes); Long War Journal.

⁷ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 times in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, January 1, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_strike_15.php.

were killed. The New America Foundation lists 8 sources⁸ and states that 4 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites Xinhua News Agency (China) and states that 4 militants were killed.⁹

Range of reported dead: 4

BIJ: 4 total

NAF: 4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4 militants killed. The only source for identification as “militants” is anonymous officials, and there is no further identifying information.¹⁰

4. January 7 2011

Ghar Laley, North Waziristan

This strike hit a house and a vehicle, apparently a motorcycle. News reports indicate that 4-6 people were killed. Those killed were suspected militants, according to anonymous officials cited in the reports. One source, the Pakistan Observer (Pakistan), states that while officials said those killed were suspected militants, locals said that the deceased were “ordinary tribesmen.”

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism refers to 10 news sources,¹¹ and states that 4-6 in total were killed. Reflecting the Pakistan Observer’s report, the Bureau notes that 0-6 of those killed may have been civilians.

The New America Foundation refers to 6 news sources,¹² and states that 4-5 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites a single source, Geo TV, and states that 5 militants were killed.¹³

Range of reported dead: 4-6

⁸ Geo TV (as above); AP (link broken); Reuters (link broken); AFP/Express Tribune (as above); BBC (15 people killed in 3 strikes); CNN (as above); LA Times (19 people killed over the day); Dawn (does not appear to report this strike).

⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 times in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, January 1, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_strike_15.php.

¹⁰ This creates a total count for the day of 22-24 killed, which is higher than any of the total counts in those reports which include all of the day’s strikes (the lowest count that includes all 4 strikes is 19, the highest is 20). This is because the death count for the first strikes later went up based on AP research.

¹¹ Eleven sources are listed, but the same BBC hyperlink is provided twice. The sources are: BBC (4 people dead, suspected militants according to Pakistani officials); Geo TV (up to 5 suspected militants killed); Dawn (5 suspected militants killed); Express Tribune (4 people killed); CNN (4 alleged militants killed); One India (6 suspected terrorists killed); Pakistan Observer (6 people killed, suspected militants or ordinary tribesmen); SATP (6 suspected militants); Xinhua (at least 4 people); Long War Journal.

¹² Geo TV (as above); Express Tribune (as above); BBC (as above); CNN (as above).

¹³ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 5 ‘militants’ in al Qaeda haven of Datta Khel, The Long War Journal, January 7, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_kill_5_1.php.

BIJ: 4-6 total; 0-6 civilians

NAF: 4-5 militants

LWJ: 5 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials (claiming that deceased were militants), “local sources,” locals (claiming that deceased were “ordinary tribesmen”).

Conclusion: Total 4-6 reported killed. Weak identification of 0-6 militants and 0-6 civilians – the only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials, and this is in conflict with the Pakistan Observer report that the deceased were “ordinary tribesmen”. No identifying information is provided supporting either the claim that those killed were militants or that they were civilians. The Pakistan Observer report that the deceased were “ordinary tribesmen” is reported in contrast to claims that those killed were militants. In our view, this must amount to a report of civilian deaths.

5. January 12 2011

Haiderkhel, North Waziristan

This strike attacked a building, reportedly a militant compound. BBC reports that the compound belonged to Zafar Khan, who is linked to the militant group led by Hafiz Gul Bahadar. AFP and Geo TV report that according to unnamed officials, those killed were “foreigners.” The reports provide a death count of between 3 and 5 people. No civilians were reported killed, and all of those killed were suspected militants according to “officials.”

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 8 news sources,¹⁴ and states that between 3-5 in total were killed. The New America Foundation cites 5 news sources,¹⁵ and states that between 3-4 militants were killed. Before updating its data and website, New America had included a reference to Pajhwok which reported 5 people killed. The reference has now been deleted and the upper figure amended to 4.

The Long War Journal states that 4 foreigners – “a term used to describe Arab al Qaeda or Central Asian terrorists” - were killed, citing a dead link to Samaa TV (Pakistan) and an Agence France-Press (AFP)/Dawn report stating that at least 3 militants were killed.¹⁶

Range of reported dead: 3-5

BIJ: 3-5 total

NAF: 3-4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

¹⁴ BBC (3 militants killed); AFP (at least 3 militants killed); Pajhwok (5 militants killed); CNN (4 alleged militants killed); Geo TV (4 suspected militants killed); Xinhua (3 people killed); SATP (5 militants killed); Long War Journal; Al Jazeera (3 people killed – the link is titled Long War Journal but connects to an Al Jazeera article).

¹⁵ BBC (as above); AFP (as above); CNN (as above); Geo TV (as above); Wall Street Journal (4 people killed).

¹⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 4 ‘foreigners’ in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, January 12, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_killed.php.

Sources: Anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-5 militants – although one report (BBC) identifies the owner of the targeted compound and the militant group he is allegedly affiliated with, the sole source of information is anonymous officials.

6. January 18 2011

Dashgar, Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This strike hit a building, allegedly a compound. According to officials, those killed were militants. Reports indicate that 3-5 people were killed, and additionally the South Asia Terrorism Portal (SATP) (India) indicates that 7 suspected militants were killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 6 sources,¹⁷ and states that 3-7 people were killed.

The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources,¹⁸ and states that 4-5 militants were killed.

The Long War Journal cites 2 news sources,¹⁹ and states that 5 militants were killed.²⁰

Range of reported dead: 3-7

BIJ: 3-7 total

NAF: 4-5 militants

LWJ: 5 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-7 militants killed. The only source of information for the number of dead and their identification as militants is anonymous officials, with no further identifying information.

7. January 23 2011

Doga Mada Khel, North Waziristan

This strike hit a vehicle parked outside a house, apparently destroying the vehicle, killing its occupants, and damaging part of the house. A number of reports state that 4 suspected militants were killed, according to anonymous officials. However, Al Jazeera English reports that at least 5 armed fighters were killed. Geo TV reports that 3 militants were killed but this may have been a typographical error, as it also reports that 3 militants were killed in a second strike, but then gives a total of 7 dead). Italian news agency Adnkranos reports that the target was the base used

¹⁷ The News (at least 4 militants killed); Army Times (4 alleged militants killed); Xinhua (3 people killed); Geo TV (5 militants killed); SATP (7 suspected militants killed); Long War Journal. There is also a dead link to MSN News.

¹⁸ The News (as above); AFP (5 militants killed); AP (4 alleged militants killed); Geo TV (5 militants killed).

¹⁹ AFP/Dawn (at least 5 militants); Xinhua (as above).

²⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 5 ‘militants’ in al Qaeda stronghold of Datta Khel, The Long War Journal, January 18, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_kill_5_2.php.

by the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan, and that those killed included Arabs and Turks. Other reports do not identify the group targeted. No civilians were reported killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 12 sources,²¹ and states that 4-5 people were killed.

The New America Foundation cites 6 sources,²² and states that 3-4 militants were killed. It does not include Al Jazeera's figure of 5, although this is listed as a source.

The Long War Journal cites a single source, AFP, and states that 4 militants were reported killed.²³

Range of reported dead: 3-5

BIJ: 4-5 total

NAF: 3-4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, unidentified sources, tribesmen (Xinhua).

Conclusion: Medium identification of 4-5 militants killed. Anonymous officials' statements are somewhat corroborated by Xinhua's reports citing local tribesmen who stated that the vehicle and house were destroyed. One Italian news agency identifies the target as the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan. In our view the lower reported number of 3 in Geo TV is most likely a typographical error.

8. January 23 2011

Doga Mada Khel, North Waziristan

This second strike in Doga Mada Khel reportedly struck a motorcycle, killing between 2-3 people according to reports. Al Jazeera and the Independent reported that those killed were suspected foreign fighters or militants.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 news sources,²⁴ and states that 2-3 people in total were killed.

The New America Foundation cites 6 sources,²⁵ and states that 2-3 militants were killed.

²¹ Geo TV (3 militants killed, may have meant 4); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); AFP (4 militants killed); The Independent (4 suspected militants killed); The Nation (4 suspected militants killed); Adnkranos; CBS (4 suspected militants killed); World Socialist Web Site (4 militants killed); Xinhua (4 suspected militants killed); Long War Journal; Dawn (4 people killed); SATP (13 terrorists killed throughout the day, including other strikes).

²² CNN (as above); AFP (as above); Geo TV (as above); AP (6 killed in this strike and the following strike); AFP/Express Tribune (4 militants killed); Al Jazeera (at least 5 armed fighters killed).

²³ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 times in al Qaeda haven of North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, January 23, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_strike_16.php.

²⁴ Geo TV (3 militants killed); CNN (2 suspected militants killed); AFP (3 militants killed); Al Jazeera (2 suspected foreign fighters killed); The Independent/AP (2 foreign militants killed); The Nation (3 suspected militants killed); World Socialist Web Site (3 people killed); Xinhua (3 people killed); Dawn (3 people killed); Long War Journal.

The Long War Journal cites a single source, AFP, and states that 3 militants were killed.²⁶

Range of reported dead: 2-3

BIJ: 2-3 total

NAF: 2-3 militants

LWJ: 3 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, witnesses (confirming 3 people killed, not identity as militants)

Conclusion: Weak identification of 2-3 militants killed. "Officials" state 2-3 were killed, but the figure of 3 is corroborated by local witnesses. While local sources corroborate the number of dead, the sole source of identification of those killed as "militants" is from anonymous officials, and the only other identifying information is reported suspicion those targeted were "foreign."

9. January 23 2011

Razmak, North Waziristan

The third strike of the day targeted a vehicle, reportedly parked inside a compound. Reports indicated that, according to anonymous officials, 6 suspected militants had been killed. The Nation (Pakistan) reports 4 killed, and also stated that "local residents said they had seen drones flying over the area after the attacks." No civilians were reported killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 6 sources,²⁷ and concludes that 4-6 people were killed in total.

The New America Foundation cites the same sources as for the above two strikes, and concludes that 6 militants were killed.

The Long War Journal cites a single source (AFP) and states that 6 "terrorists" were killed.²⁸

Range of reported dead: 4-6

BIJ: 4-6 total

NAF: 6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, presence of drones in sky corroborated by "local residents" (The Nation)

²⁵ As for the previous strike

²⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 times in al Qaeda haven of North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, January 23, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_strike_16.php.

²⁷ CNN (6 suspected militants killed); AFP (6 militants killed); The Nation (4 suspected militants killed); World Socialist Web Site (at least 6 people killed); Long War Journal; Dawn (6 suspected militants killed).

²⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 times in al Qaeda haven of North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, January 23, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/01/us_predators_strike_16.php.

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-6 militants killed. The presence of drones is corroborated by local resident sightings according to The Nation, but the number of people killed and their identification as militants is based solely on anonymous officials. No further identifying information is provided.

10. February 20 2011

Kaza Panga, South Waziristan

This strike hit a building, allegedly a compound, and is notable for being the first strike after the arrest of CIA contractor Raymond Davis in Pakistan. Reports range from at least 4 to at least 7 people killed. A number of reports indicate that foreigners were among those killed: 3 from Turkmenistan and 2 Arabs according to Al Jazeera and Reuters/Express Tribune, 3 Arabs, 2 Turkmen and 2 local militants according to Indo-Asian News Service (IANS, India)/sify.com (India). The Guardian also reports that people of Arab origin and Turkmen were believed to be among those killed. BBC reports that those killed included militants from Punjab province. Free Republic and Fox News report that Abu Zaid al-Iraqi, a senior al-Qaeda operative and top financier, was among those killed. One source, The News (Pakistan), states that the house targeted belonged to one Hukam Khan and that all those killed were tribal people.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 16 news sources,²⁹ and reports that 6-7 people were killed. The Bureau's sources range from 4-7 killed.

The New America Foundation cites 7 news sources,³⁰ and reports that 4-7 militants including 1 militant leader (Abu Zaid al-Iraqi) were killed.

The Long War Journal reported on February 20, 2011, that 5 militants were killed, citing an AFP report.³¹ The following day the Journal reported that 5-7 militants were reported killed, including "Punjabi" terrorists and "foreigners" according to reports. The Journal also reported the alleged death of Abu Zaid al Iraq but noted that US officials had cautioned against relying on reports of his death without communication from Al Qaeda. The Journal cites two news sources for the second report: AP (link broken), and BBC.³²

Range of reported dead: 4-7

BIJ: 6-7 total

²⁹ Geo TV (at least 6 people killed); Al Jazeera (at least 7 people killed); BBC (at least 4 people killed); CNN (6 suspected militants killed); Reuters/Express Tribune (7 people killed); SATP (at least 5 militants killed); Xinhua (at least 6 people killed); The Guardian (7 alleged militants killed); amerpundit.com (6 militants killed); Free Republic (7 people killed); Fox News (7 people killed); The Nation (at least 6 people killed); The News (6 people killed); Long War Journal (5 militants killed); sify.com (7 people killed); Long War Journal (5-7 militants killed).

³⁰ Geo TV/AFP (as above); BBC (as above); CNN (as above); Express Tribune/Reuters (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); The Guardian (as above); AP (7 militants killed).

³¹ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, February 20, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/02/us_predators_strike_17.php#ixzz1RJzkFSsb.

³² Bill Roggio, Al Qaeda operative, 'Punjabis' thought killed in South Waziristan Predator strike, The Long War Journal, February 21, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/02/al_qaeda_operative_p.php#ixzz1RK11RhZw.

NAF: 4-7 militants

LWJ: 5-7 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials, tribal sources (for figure of 6 killed, The News), local tribesmen (for the owner of house and claim that all dead are tribal people, The News).

Conclusion: 5-7 total killed. Strong identification of 1 named militant unconfirmed as killed, weak identification of an additional 4-6 militants killed. The only source for the identity of those killed as militants is anonymous officials, but one leader who is allegedly killed is identified by name, and others are identified by nationality. In our opinion, the lower figure of 4 from the BBC has been superseded. The BBC report does not account for later reports of 3 Turkmen and 2 Arabs (one of which is named as al Iraqi). However, unlike the Bureau, we are not convinced that the figure of 5 killed has clearly superseded. We believe that The News' report that all the dead were tribal people is not clear enough to suggest that they were civilians, in light of the contrary reports.

11. February 21 2011

Spalga, North Waziristan

This strike hit a building, allegedly a compound. Reports range from 5 people killed to at least 11. The reports indicate that according to officials, those killed were suspected militants, and the BBC reports that "local tribesmen told the BBC that the house was being used as a base by Taliban militants." However The News reports that "the villagers claim all the victims were local tribes people and had no affiliation with the militants." BBC reports that those killed included foreigners. Beyond this, the suspected militants are not identified.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists 10 sources,³³ and states that 7-11 people were killed. This range does not include the lower estimate of 6 people killed in some of the sources the Bureau cites to--or the lower estimate of 5 killed in a report by Geo TV/AFP that the Bureau does not cite. The Bureau lists the number of civilians killed as 0-11 based on the lone report from The News that none of the victims were affiliated with militants.

Citing 4 news sources, the New America Foundation states that 5-8 militants were killed.³⁴ New America lists The News' report as one of its sources, however it does not incorporate the reported claim that those killed were not militants. New America lists The News' source as "officials," and fails to list the fact that villagers/tribal sources are also cited by The News.

The Long War Journal cites one source, Dawn, and states that 9 militants were reported killed.³⁵ The following day, Dawn published a second article stating that 10 – 11 people had been killed, a higher estimate that is not reflected in the Long War Journal's numbers.³⁶

³³ The News (8 killed); Express Tribune; Amerpundit (6 killed); BBC News (at least 7 killed); Dawn (10-11 killed); antiwar.com (8 killed); sify.com (8 killed); SATP (10 killed); Washington Times (8 killed); Long War Journal (9 killed).

³⁴ AP (8 suspected militants killed), BBC News (as above); The News (as above); and Geo/AFP (at least 5 killed).

³⁵ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in Pakistan, kill 9 'militants', The Long War Journal, February 21, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/02/us_predators_strike_18.php.

Range of reported dead: 5-11

BIJ: 7-11 total, 0-11 civilians

NAF: 5-8 militants

LWJ: 9 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials, villagers/local tribesmen (for claim that 8 people killed and that all killed were local tribes people, The News; for claim that the target was used as a base by the Taliban, BBC).

Conclusion: 7-11 killed, may have been militants or civilians. Medium identification of 0-11 militants, weak identification of 0-11 civilians. Anonymous officials' statements are corroborated by locals' reports of a Taliban base, as against The News report that villagers said those killed were not affiliated with militants. There is no further identifying information to support either claim. Regarding the number of individuals killed, the lower estimates of 5-6 people that media reported on February 21 are not repeated in any subsequent media reports on February 22. It seems likely that that the lower figures were superseded, particularly as one source, Dawn, provided a second report on the 22nd giving an estimate of 10-11. Taking a conservative approach, we take a lower number of 7, as 7 is the next lowest number reported and it is repeated in BBC's report on February 22.

12. February 24 2011

Mohammed Khel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a house and a car. Reports indicate that between 4 and 7 people died in the strike. No civilians were reported killed. The BBC reports that 2 foreigners, Turkmen, were among those killed according to officials and local tribesmen.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 9 news sources,³⁷ and states that 5-7 people were killed. This does not account for a Reuters report giving 4 dead.

The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources,³⁸ and states that 4-5 militants were killed. NAF lists only "officials" as the BBC source.

The Long War Journal refers to 2 news sources,³⁹ and reports that 6 militants were killed.⁴⁰

³⁶ See: Pazir Gul, 10 killed in drone strike, Dawn, February 22, 2011, available at <http://dawn.com/2011/02/22/10-killed-in-drone-strike/>; Agencies, US missiles kill nine in North Waziristan, Dawn, February 21, 2011, available at <http://dawn.com/2011/02/21/us-missiles-kill-nine-in-north-waziristan/>.

³⁷ The Nation (at least 6 suspected militants killed); Top News (at least 5 militants killed); Reuters (at least 4 militants killed); BBC (at least 5 militants killed); CNN (5 suspected militants killed); Dawn (at least 6 people killed); Monsters and Critics/South Asia News (7 people killed, at least 5 in the house and 2 in the vehicle); Xinhua (at least 6 people killed); Long War Journal.

³⁸ BBC (as above); CNN (as above); Express Tribune/Reuters (at least 4 militants killed); Reuters (at least 4 militants killed).

³⁹ Dawn (as above); AP (link broken).

⁴⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 6 'militants' in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, February 24, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/02/us_predators_kill_6_4.php.

Range of reported dead: 4-7

BIJ: 5-7 total

NAF: 4-5 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials, local tribesmen

Conclusion: Medium identification of 5-7 militants killed. Two of those killed are minimally identified as Turkmen, and anonymous officials are somewhat corroborated by local tribesmen. The Bureau treats reports giving the lower figure of 4 as superseded by later reports. This is probably the case, as all of the reports of 4-5 individuals killed but one are dated February 24, and reports on the next day state 6 were killed. The exception is Top News, which on February 25 reported at least 5 militants killed, but this appears to be based on the previous day's BBC report. We agree that the figure of 4, reported once by Reuters on February 24, is superseded, particularly as it stands alone and is based on a single source, unlike some later reports. Although it may have been superseded, we take 5 as our lower figure, as media reports repeat it on February 25, and it is also the figure given by the BBC, which cites both officials and local tribesmen.

13. March 8 2011

Landidog, South Waziristan

The target of this strike was reportedly a building owned by local tribesman Fazal Karam, which militants used as a compound. Reports indicate that 5 people were killed. The Daily Times (Pakistan) cites a "tribal source" as stating that one person was killed, but notes officials put the death count at 5.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 9 sources,⁴¹ and states that 5 people were killed, including 0-5 civilians. The source for the possibility that those killed were civilians is the Bureau's own research, and the Pakistan Observer. Chris Woods from the Bureau noted that the link to the Pakistan Observer report is dead, and that the Bureau cannot relocate it. However he provided us with the text of the report which the Bureau saved, which does support the count of 0-5 civilians.

The New America Foundation cites 5 sources and states that 5 militants were killed.⁴²

The Long War Journal refers to 1 news source, Dawn, and states that 5 militants were killed.⁴³

Range of reported dead: 5

BIJ: 5 total, 0-5 civilians

⁴¹ Xinhua (5 people killed); AP (listed as CBS, 5 alleged militants killed); Daily Times (5 people killed); amerpundit.com (at least 5 militants killed); Long War Journal; SATP (5 militants killed); Dawn/AFP (5 militants killed); Dawn (5 militants killed); Pakistan Observer.

⁴² AFP (5 militants killed); BBC (at least 5 suspected militants killed); Daily Times (as above); Dawn (5 militants killed); ABC News (5 militants killed).

⁴³ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 5 in strike in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, March 8, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_kill_5_3.php.

NAF: 5 militants

LWJ: 5 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials, a tribal source (witness to 1 dead, identification of house).

Conclusion: 5 total killed. Weak identification of 0-5 militants, 0-5 civilians killed. The only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials. While the owner of the building is identified, it is not suggested that the owner himself was either killed or was a militant. The possibility that those killed were civilians is revealed by the Bureau's primary research.

14. March 9 2011

Ismailkhel, North Waziristan

This strike—which does not appear to have been widely reported—allegedly hit a house, killing 4-5 people. No civilians were reported killed. It is not clear whether it occurred on March 8 or 9.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 3 sources,⁴⁴ and states that 5 people were killed. New America had not initially counted this strike, but it is now included. It provides 2 news sources⁴⁵ and states 4-5 militants were killed. The Long War Journal does not appear to count the strike.

Range of reported dead: 4-5

BIJ: 5 total

NAF: 4-5 militants

LWJ: 0

Sources: [unclear or unspecified]

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-5 militants reported dead. Although reputable news outlets reported the strike, their original sources are not clear. No identifying information is provided beyond the claim that the deceased were militants.

15. March 11 2011

Khaisor, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a truck. A follow up attack a few moments later reportedly killed rescuers. The reported number of dead ranged from 5 to 12. On March 12, in its second report on the strike, Dawn reported that 2 civilians were killed, although it is not completely clear whether this refers to the Khaisor strike or a separate drone attack which also occurred on March 11. The Dawn report also refers to the rescuers as “local people.” The Pakistan Observer reports residents as saying “that all the victims appeared to be ordinary tribesmen.” In contrast, the Express Tribune/AFP and Dawn report anonymous officials as saying that those killed were militants.

⁴⁴ Xinhua (5 people killed); SATP (5 militants killed); Dawn (5 suspected terrorists killed).

⁴⁵ Dawn (as above); ABC News (4 people killed).

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 8 news sources⁴⁶ and lists a total of 6-12 deaths, including 5 civilian deaths. The Bureau did its own primary research in Waziristan and concluded that 5 civilian rescuers were killed, together with 5 Taliban. The Bureau has published the names of the five civilians killed.

The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources,⁴⁷ and lists a total of 5-6 deaths, including 3-4 militant deaths and 2 “unknown” deaths. New America notes that “some reports say rescuers were civilians.”

Relying on a single source, Dawn, the Long War Journal reports 5 militant deaths, and makes no mention of civilian deaths.⁴⁸ Five is the lowest reported number of dead, reported by Dawn on March 11. The following day, Dawn published a new report stating at least 6 people had been killed.

Range of reported dead: 5-12

BIJ: 6-12 total, 5 civilians

NAF: 5-6 total, 3-4 militants, 2 unknown.

LWJ: 5 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials; residents/local people; Bureau investigation

Conclusion: Total 6-12 killed. Strong identification of 5 civilians killed, who are identified by name. Strong identification of 1 militant, medium identification of further 0-5. The claim by anonymous officials that those killed were militants, and the claims of local residents that civilians were killed, are both corroborated by the Bureau’s independent researchers in Waziristan who were able to name the civilian dead. The lower reported figure of 5 from Dawn is in our view superseded, including by a second article in Dawn.

16. March 11 2011

Ghoresti, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly targeted a white car, killing all four occupants. Dawn notes that according to some reports, there were foreigners among the dead, but states that such reports could not be verified. The News refers to reports that the deceased were militants. No civilians are reported killed.

⁴⁶ Jang (Urdu language); Pakistan Observer (up to 6 people killed); Express Tribune/AFP (6 militants killed); Dawn (6 people killed, 2 civilians killed); Long War Journal; BBC Pakistan (link broken); The News (10 bodies uncovered); United News Service (12 people killed).

⁴⁷ Dawn (as above); Express Tribune/AFP (as above); The News (as above); The Daily Times (5 militants killed).

⁴⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 5 in al Qaeda haven in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, March 11, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_kill_5_4.php#ixzz1RL6rH8Kh.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 5 news sources,⁴⁹ and states that 4 people were killed in total. New America did not initially count this strike, but now cites the same sources as for the previous strike, and states 4-10 militants were killed. The Long War Journal does not appear to count this strike.

Range of reported dead: 4-10

BIJ: 4 people

NAF: 4-10 militants

LWJ: 0

Sources: Villagers, unspecified

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4 militants killed. Secondary reports indicate that they may have been militants, but no reports cite a direct source saying such. We discount AFP's upper figure of 10 as it appears to be an outlier, and AFP reports the details as "sketchy and unconfirmed".

17. March 13 2011

Azam Warsak, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly attacked a moving vehicle. Conflicting reports state that the occupants were struck and killed; or that the drone missed its target and all of the occupants escaped alive. Anonymous officials are cited as supporting both stories. Dawn reports that eyewitnesses stated 4 suspected militants were killed, although it is unclear if it is talking about the same strike in this location. Pajhwok (Afghanistan) cites a named official, Fazli Malik, and villagers, as stating that 4 fighters were killed, although again it is unclear whether this is the same strike, as it appears they may be referring to North Waziristan.

The Bureau cites 8 news sources and states that 0-4 people were killed.⁵⁰ New America originally stated that 0-4 people were killed, but recently changed its sources and now states that 0 were killed.⁵¹ An additional entry for March 13 includes another strike in Azam Warsak in which 0-4 people were killed – however it appears that this is a second listing of the same strike which was erroneously not deleted, as none of the sources provide for three strikes on this day, and it is not included in New America's sources document. The Long War Journal also does not account for the reported possibility that people were killed. The Journal cites one source, AFP (no link provided), and reports that the drone missed its target.⁵²

Range of reported dead: 0-4

⁴⁹ AFP/Express Tribune (As many as 10 dead, but details "sketchy and unconfirmed"); Dawn (4 people killed); BBC News Pakistan (link broken); The News (4 people killed); United News Service (4 people killed).

⁵⁰ Express Tribune (4 suspected militants killed, others escaped); Express Tribune/AFP (0 killed); AFP (0 killed); Xinhua (4 people killed); All Voices (0 killed); Dawn (4 suspected militants killed, unclear); Pajhwok (4 fighters killed, unclear); Long War Journal.

⁵¹ AFP (as above); Express Tribune/AFP (as above); Daily Times (0 killed). Sources initially included the other Express Tribune source listed above, putting the death count at 4.

⁵² Bill Roggio, US Predators miss target in South Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, March 13, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_miss_ta.php.

BIJ: 0-4 total

NAF: 0 total

LWJ: 0 total

Sources: Anonymous officials, named official (unclear if same strike); eyewitnesses (unclear if same strike).

Conclusion: Medium identification of 0-4 militants killed. Official claims that those targeted were militants is corroborated by villagers and eyewitnesses as reported in Dawn and Pajhwok, although it is not completely clear that those reports are discussing the same strike. Although there is limited corroboration, there is no identifying information to support the claim that those killed were militants.

18. March 13 2011

Spalga, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle and a building. According to anonymous officials who spoke to AFP, the building was a compound owned and run by Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan leader Rahimullah, although it was not clear whether he was among those killed or injured. Reports indicate that 6 people were killed. No civilians were reported killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 sources⁵³ and reports that 6-7 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources, and states that 3-6 militants were killed.⁵⁴ The Long War Journal refers to one source, Dawn/AFP, and states that 6 militants were killed.⁵⁵

Range of reported dead: 3-7

BIJ: 6-7 total

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: Anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-7 militants killed. Anonymous officials are the sole source for the figure and the identification of the individuals killed as militants. The “militant” identification is minimally supported by the identification of the compound attacked as

⁵³ AFP/Express Tribune (6 militants killed); Wall Street Journal (3 militants killed); AFP (6 militants killed); SATP (6 militants killed); Pajhwok (6 insurgents killed); Long War Journal; Xinhua (6 people killed); Dawn (4 killed, AP update of 7); Monsters and Critics/South Asia News (6 alleged militants killed); Long War Journal.

⁵⁴ AFP/Express Tribune (as above); AFP (as above); Wall Street Journal (as above); Daily Times (6 militants killed).

⁵⁵ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in Pakistan’s tribal areas, The Long War Journal, March 13, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_strike_19.php. See also: Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in North Waziristan, kill 6, The Long War Journal, March 14, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_strike_20.php#ixzz1RLTB4spl.

belonging to Rahimullah, but that fact itself is uncorroborated. We conservatively adopt a lower figure of 3, as reported by the Wall Street Journal. In response to this approach, Chris Woods of the Bureau of Investigative Journalism stated that the Wall Street Journal was relying on an early Reuters report, and pointed out that the report states “at least” 3 killed. All other reports cited 6 killed, with Associated Press updating early reports to provide a figure of 7 deaths.

19. March 14 2011

Malik Jashdar, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a moving vehicle, killing between 3-6 people. Anonymous officials are cited as stating that those killed were militants. UT San Diego reports officials as saying that those killed included 2 Arab militants and 2 local fighters, and that the “vehicle was laden with explosives when it was struck in the village of Malik Jashdar.” The News cites tribal sources and eyewitnesses as stating that four men were killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 11 sources⁵⁶ and states that 3-6 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 sources,⁵⁷ and states that 3-6 militants were killed.

The Long War Journal states that 6 unidentified people were killed. It cites one source, the Express Tribune, but the link is to an article from Dawn discussing a different strike.⁵⁸

Range of reported dead: 3-6

BIJ: 3-6 total

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 6 people killed

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources/eyewitnesses

Conclusion: Weak claim of 3-6 militants killed. Given the timing of the reports it is not clear, in our view, that higher estimates are a result of more information over time. Anonymous officials are corroborated by eyewitnesses for the claim that 4 people died, but not for the identification of those killed as militants. A small amount of supporting identifying information is provided by UT San Diego and the Daily Times.

20. March 16 2011

Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This strike hit either a vehicle or a building. Reports indicate that 4-5 people were killed. No civilians were reported killed.

⁵⁶ BBC (at least 3 militants killed); SATP (5 militants killed); Express Tribune (at least 3 militants killed); UT San Diego (4 militants killed); All Voices (link broken); Monsters and Critics/South Asia News (4 people killed); The Nation (link broken); The News (4 men killed).

⁵⁷ CNN (6 alleged militants killed); BBC (as above); Express Tribune (as above); Daily Times (4 people killed).

⁵⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in North Waziristan, kill 6, The Long War Journal, March 14, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_strike_20.php.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 5 news sources⁵⁹ and states that 4-5 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources⁶⁰ and states that 4-6 militants were killed. However the source relied on for the upper figure of 6 is a CNN report which actually refers to the March 14 strike. The Long War Journal cites 2 news sources, and states that 5 militants were killed. This does not include the figure provided in the cited Dawn report of 4 killed.⁶¹

Range of reported dead: 4-5

BIJ: 4-5 total

NAF: 4-6 militants

LWJ: 5 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-5 militants killed. Only source is anonymous officials, no identifying information provided.

21. March 17 2011

Datta Khel, North Waziristan

A number of sources state that this strike targeted a peaceful jirga, gathered to discuss a local mining dispute, and that the majority of those killed were civilians although some Taliban may have been present. Tribal elders and members of the local Khassadar police force were reportedly amongst those killed. An elder had reportedly purchased rights to a large tract of trees, and had found that the underlying land contained chromite. The jirga was to settle a dispute over who could mine the chromite, and Taliban may have been present as they controlled some of the relevant area. A number of civilian dead have been named, and with the exception of a few early reports, the reports indicate the majority of those killed were peaceful civilians.

US officials continue to maintain that the strike targeted a militant training center. The only source for this claim is anonymous U.S. officials, who have stated that the target was “not the local men’s glee club”, “not a charity car wash”, and not a “gathering for a bake sale, they were terrorists.”⁶²

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists a total of 24 sources,⁶³ and states a total death count of 42-53, of which 31-42 are civilians. A number of reports state that the deaths were “mostly”

⁵⁹ AFP/Express Tribune (at least 5 militants killed); Dawn (at least 4 people killed); BBC (at least 5 suspected militants killed); Xinhua (at least 4 people killed); Long War Journal.

⁶⁰ CNN (wrong strike); AFP/Express Tribune (as above); Dawn (as above); BBC (as above).

⁶¹ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike in Datta Khel area in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, March 16, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_strike_21.php.

⁶² Foreign Policy

⁶³ BBC (some 40 people killed); whatsondalian.com (41 killed immediately, 7 over the following week); Wall Street Journal (up to 40 killed); Xinhua (41 killed, including 6 tribal elders and some children); AFP (39 killed, including civilians and police); CNN (44 killed, mostly civilians); BBC (about 40 killed, including 1 Taliban); Long War Journal; The Economist (40 killed, mostly civilian); New York Times (citing the BIJ’s study); Reprieve (50 killed); BIJ’s own study; AP (38 civilians and 4 Taliban killed); Leigh, Pay & Co. Solicitors (more than 40 killed); Al Jazeera English (35 suspected Taliban killed); CNN

civilian, and AP reports 38 civilian deaths. Additionally, the Bureau's field researchers were able to name 18 civilian victims of the strike, including 5 members of the Khassadar police force. The leader of the jirga has also been named, and a further 5 victims are named in sworn affidavits filed in the High Court in London. This gives a total of 24 civilians who are identified by name. Another of the deceased is identified as Sharabat Khan, who was reported to be a militant and/or the leaseholder of the mine under dispute.

The New America Foundation list 7 news sources,⁶⁴ and concludes that 22-45 people of "unknown" identity were killed. This is an understandable approach to the strike given the difficulty of identifying the exact number of militants vs. civilians killed based on the reports. However, our view is that the reports clearly and strongly indicate that a significant number of civilians, and a much smaller number of militants, were killed. At least 24 of the civilians are identified very strongly and by name. As such, recording the identity of all the deceased as "unknown" has the effect of warping the reported civilian casualty figures for the entire year. This is however an improvement on New America's former record which stated 11-12 militants and 13-24 "others" were killed (giving an implied total of 24-36 deaths). Curiously, in its sources document, New America lists only "officials" as the original source – see in contrast the wide range of original sources listed below.

The Long War Journal refers to 6 news sources,⁶⁵ and to reports of death counts between 14 and 35.⁶⁶ The significant number of reports putting deaths at around 40 are not referred to. The Journal notes the differing accounts of whether those killed were militants or civilians, and how this is reflected in the Journal's numbers is not clear.

Range of reported dead: 14-53

BIJ: 42-53 total; 31-42 civilians

NAF: 22-45 "unknown"

LWJ: 14 – 35 total (implied 0-35 militants, 0-35 civilians)

Sources: For the claim that all those killed were militants: anonymous officials. For the claim that it was a peaceful jirga and mostly killed civilians: anonymous officials; named officials (including Army Chief of Staff Gen. Ashfaq Kayani, Ambassador Hussain Haqqani, Foreign Secretary Salman Bashir, Governor Masood Kasur, Prime Minister Gilani, Member of National Assembly Kamran Khan); the Taliban; un-named and anonymous locals/tribesmen; named

(up to 30 killed); BBC (at least 40 killed, most believed to be civilians); Reuters (link broken); The News (22 suspected militants killed); Geo TV (22 suspected militants killed); Express Tribune (at least 38 killed including 12 Taliban and 14 tribal elders); Foreign Policy (up to 45 civilians and tribal elders killed); Foreign Policy (approximately 40 killed); AFP (39 killed including 12 Pakistani Taliban).

One additional link is broken.

⁶⁴ Al Jazeera English (as above); CNN (as above); BBC (as above); The News (as above); Geo TV (as above); Express Tribune (as above); AFP (as above).

⁶⁵ Geo TV (14 suspected militants); Al Jazeera; Dawn; Reuters; AP; and in its second article on the strike, the New York Times.

⁶⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in al Qaeda stronghold of Datta Khel, The Long War Journal, Marc 17, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/us_predators_strike_22.php; Bill Roggio, Pakistan's Army chief 'condemns' US Predator airstrike in Datta Khel, The Long War Journal, March 17, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/03/pakistans_army_chief.php.

locals/tribesmen (farmer Gul Ahmed, Samiullah Khan); Bureau investigation; legal documents and court proceedings lodged on behalf of victims.

Conclusion: 39-53 total; 38-45 civilians killed, strong identification of 24 named civilians; 1-12 Taliban, 1 strongly identified by name.

That this strike targeted a peaceful jirga, killing civilians, is supported by a large number of sources, and much reported information and detail about the strike supports this claim. In the circumstances of this case, we believe the claim that all or most of those killed were militants is fanciful. The lowest reasonable number of deaths, in our view, is 39 dead. The vast majority of reports place the figure at around 40 dead. Reports of less than 39 killed were all on the day of the strike and the following day, and are superseded by a large number of later reports. We adopt the Bureau's high figure of 53, which is based on the Bureau's primary research. The reports indicate that "most" of those killed were civilians, with Foreign Policy providing the highest number of up to 45 civilians killed. We take this as an upper number of civilian deaths. 24 civilians are identified by name. Few reports provide a solid figure of civilian deaths, but an AP report dated 2 August 2011 puts the number at 38, which is consistent with reports of "most" of those killed being civilians.

The sources indicate that some Taliban were present, which is consistent with the narrative of the jirga. One Taliban commander, Sharabat Khan, is identified by name. The highest number of reported Taliban dead consistent with the jirga narrative is 12.

Further corroboration for the jirga narrative is available in *Living Under Drones*, a report by the Human Rights Law Clinics at NYU and Stanford law schools, which interviewed victims and survivors of the attack.⁶⁷

22. April 13 2011

Angor Adda, South Waziristan

This strike is reported to have targeted a truck, a motorcycle, and a house. The New York Times reports that those killed were militants commanded by Maulvi Nazir, a Taliban leader from South Waziristan, closely linked to the Haqqani network. AFP reports that those killed were Haqqani network fighters, and that they were all Afghans.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 8 sources,⁶⁸ and states that 6-7 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 sources,⁶⁹ and states that 4-6 militants were killed. New America had initially cited 7 sources, and given an upper figure of 7 based on an article from Pajhwok. The reference to Pajhwok has since been deleted.

⁶⁷ NYU Center for Human Rights and Global Justice & Stanford International Human Rights Clinic, *Living Under Drones* 57-62 (2012), available at www.livingunderdrones.org.

⁶⁸ Reuters (6 militants killed); phillyburbs.com (link broken); New York Times (7 fighters killed); AFP (6 fighters killed); CNN (6 suspected militants killed); Pajhwok (7 people killed); Xinhua (6 people killed); Long War Journal.

⁶⁹ AFP (as above); CNN (as above); BBC (4 people killed); New York Times (as above).

The Long War Journal states that 6 Haqqani network fighters were killed.⁷⁰

Range of reported dead: 4-7

BIJ: 6-7 total

NAF: 4-6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, named residents (Rahimullah Wazir, Salim); named official (Khiyal Gul).

Conclusion: Medium identification of 6-7 militants dead. The deceased are identified as militants by anonymous officials, but this is somewhat supported by local resident claims that the house was used by insurgents and that the Taliban cordoned off the site. The deceased are further identified by an alleged connection to the Haqqani Network. A single report, from the BBC, puts the casualty figure at 4. As the article states that the casualties from the house were still unclear, it would strongly seem that the figure was superseded.

23. April 22 2011

Spinwan, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly targeted a compound used by supporters of Hafiz Gul Bahadar, and also hit a nearby guesthouse. Numerous reports indicate that women and children were killed, although an anonymous US official stated in response to claims that civilians had died that “There is no evidence to support that claim whatsoever.” An on the ground investigation by AP published in February 2012 states that 20 militants, 3 children, and 2 women were killed. The News quoted Maulvi Gul Ramzan as stating that the majority of those killed in the attack were his close relatives. Ramzan reportedly denied that local and foreign militants were staying in the building at the time of attack.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 news sources,⁷¹ and states that 25-26 people were killed, including 5-9 civilians. The Bureau’s own investigators in Waziristan reported some dispute over the women’s deaths, and named one of the children killed as 12 year old Atif.

The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources,⁷² and states that 17 militants, 3-9 civilians, and 3 unknowns were killed. New America notes in its sources document that the number of militants killed “Could be up to 22 by some accounts but [taking a figure of 17] is the best way to make the numbers balance.”

⁷⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predator strike kills 6 Haqqani Network fighters in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal April 13, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/04/us_predator_strike_k_8.php.

⁷¹ New York Times (23 people killed, 5 children, 4 women); The News (25 people killed, 5 children, 4 women); Reuters/Dawn (25 people killed, 3 women); Wall Street Journal (26 people killed, 3 women); BBC (at least 25 people killed, 5 women, 4 children); Geo TV (25 people killed, 3 women, 5 children); Xinhua (at least 20 people killed); CNN (25 people killed, 17 militants, 8 civilians including 5 women 3 children); Long War Journal, AP (link broken). The New York Times article is listed twice.

⁷² Dawn/Reuters (as above); Wall Street Journal (as above); CNN (as above); BBC (as above); Geo TV (as above); New York Times (as above).

The Long War Journal cites 2 news sources,⁷³ and states that 25 people, including 3 women, were killed. It is not entirely clear but the Journal appears to assume that apart from the women, those killed were militant supporters of Hafiz Gul Bahadar.⁷⁴

It appears that neither the Journal nor the New America Foundation rely on the AP investigation. This independent investigation, published in February 2012, confirms a minimum of 25 deaths, including 5 civilian deaths, and in our view supersedes earlier reports which continue to be relied on by both New America and the Journal.

Range of reported dead: 20-26 total; 3-9 civilians (women and children)

BIJ: 25-26 total; 5-9 civilians

NAF: 23-29 total killed, 17 militants killed, 3-9 civilians killed, 3 unknowns killed

LWJ: 25 people (3 civilians, 22 militants)

Sources: anonymous officials; villagers, tribal elder Mehboob Jan, Bureau investigation, AP investigation

Conclusion: 25-26 killed in total, 5-9 civilians, 17-20 militants. Strong identification of 17 militants, as claims by anonymous officials are corroborated by AP's investigation, and by a tribal elder's claim that the compound was used by militants. Militants are identified as supporters of Hafiz Gul Bahadar. Anonymous officials and a tribal elder state that women and children were amongst those killed, and the AP independently confirmed 5 deaths, providing a strong case for 5 civilian deaths. One civilian is named by the Bureau.

24. May 6 2011

Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This was the first strike following the killing of Osama Bin Laden, and appeared to be targeting a vehicle as it passed by a religious school/militant compound.

Relying on 17 sources⁷⁵ and primary investigation, the Bureau of Investigative Journalism gives a death count of 15-18 people, including 6 civilians. The upper figure of 18 deaths, and the figure of 6 civilian deaths was reported by the Bureau's researchers in Waziristan, who named each of the dead civilians. An anonymous US official rejected this research, referring only to "10 armed men" and stating that the Bureau's claim that a restaurant had been struck as "ludicrous".⁷⁶ The Bureau states that it provided the CIA with the names of the identified civilians and asked for

⁷³ Geo TV (as above); Reuters (25 militants killed).

⁷⁴ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 25 in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, April 22, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/04/us_predators_kill_5_5.php.

⁷⁵ Express Tribune/Reuters (at least 15 killed); Geo TV (8 suspected militants killed); Washington Post (13 killed); CNN (12 suspected militants killed); The News (10 militants killed); Reuters (at least 8 suspected militants killed); Dawn (13 suspected militants killed); Muslim News (17 killed including 6 civilians); AP (at least 15 killed, including at least 1 civilian); Xinhua (at least 13 killed); New York Times (15 killed); BBC (at least 12 killed); SATP (link is to 2012 data, incorrect); Dawn (13 killed, cites Reuters reporting 17 killed); Long War Journal; New York Times (citing BIJ research); AP (16 killed, 10 Taliban and 6 tribesmen).

⁷⁶ See: Scott Shane, Contrasting Reports of Drone Strikes, New York Times, August 11, 2011, available at <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/08/12/world/asia/12droneside.html?ref=asia>.

comment, but has yet to receive a response. The majority of cited news reports, including from the Washington Post, CNN, the New York Times, and the BBC, provide a higher death count than 10. AP, the New York Times, and Dawn all referred to a roadside restaurant being hit. The Bureau's finding of 6 civilian deaths is also supported by AP's on the ground investigation, published in February 2012, which found that 10 Taliban and 6 civilians had been killed in the strike.⁷⁷

Relying on 7 news sources,⁷⁸ the New America Foundation states that 8-16 people were killed, including 8 militants were killed and 0-8 unknowns. Relying on two sources, Dawn and AFP, the Long War Journal states that 13 militants were killed.⁷⁹

Range of reported dead: 8-17

BIJ: 15-18 total, 6 civilians

NAF: 8-16 total, 8 militants, 0-8 unknown

LWJ: 13 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local sources/residents, AP investigation, Bureau investigation.

Conclusion: 16-18 total killed, 10-12 militants killed, 6 civilians killed. Strong identification of 10 militants killed, strong identification of 6 named civilians killed. The AP's independent investigation corroborates a minimum number of 16 killed, which is consistent with the reported upper figures at the time of the attack. The New York Times reported that the lowest figure of 8 was updated to 15. The figure of 6 civilians killed is particularly strong having been verified by both AP and the Bureau.

New America continues to use the lower figure of 8 which was updated. Regarding the Bureau's minimum count of one lower than our own, Chris Woods of the Bureau of Investigative Journalism stated: "In light of claims to the New York Times by a US official that 'nearly ten' militants died (not the 10 reported by AP or the 12 reported by TBIJ's own researchers) the Bureau of Investigative Journalism considers it necessary to reflect this ambiguity with a 15-18 range."

25. May 10 2011

Angor Adda, South Waziristan

This strike allegedly targeted vehicles. Anonymous officials stated that those killed were militants. "Tribal sources" cited by The News stated that all of those killed were local tribesmen. AP, cited in the Long War Journal, states that three of those killed were Arabs.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 7 news sources⁸⁰ and states that 3-5 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources⁸¹ and states that 3-5 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites 3 news sources⁸² and states that 4 militants were killed.⁸³

⁷⁷ AP Investigation of US drone strikes in Pakistan, US News, February 25, 2012, available at <http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2012/02/25/ap-investigation-of-us-drone-strikes-in-pakistan>.

⁷⁸ AP (as above); New York Times (8 suspected militants killed); Express Tribune/Reuters (as above); Geo TV (as above); CNN (as above); The News (as above); Reuters (as above).

⁷⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 13 'militants' in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, May 6, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_kill_13.php.

Range of reported dead: 3-5

BIJ: 3-5 total

NAF: 3-5 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, eyewitness

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-5 militants killed. Only identification as militants is from anonymous officials.

26. May 12 2011

Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This strike attacked a vehicle, reportedly a pick-up truck. No civilians were reported killed, although The News reports that “Villagers in Dattakhel claimed that all the slain men were local tribesmen. They condemned the killing of the tribesmen...”

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 11 sources⁸⁴ and states that 7-8 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources and states that 3-8 militants were killed.⁸⁵ Referring to AFP, the Long War Journal states that up to 8 militants were killed.⁸⁶ Without providing the source, the Long War Journal later stated that 7 local and foreign militants were killed.⁸⁷

Range of reported dead: 3-8

BIJ: 7-8 total

NAF: 3-8 militants

⁸⁰ The News (5 people killed); Adnkronos (at least 4 people killed); Express Tribune (4 militants killed); The Peninsula Qatar (4 militants killed); AFP (4 militants killed); BBC (4 people killed); Long War Journal.

⁸¹ Express Tribune (as above); AFP (4 militants killed); CNN (3 alleged militants killed); The News (as above).

⁸² Dawn (4 militants killed); Samaa (4 terrorists killed); AP (link broken).

⁸³ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 4 in South Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, May 10, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_kill_4_5.php.

⁸⁴ The News (7 people killed); Dawn/AFP (at least 7 suspected militants killed); The News (5-7 suspected militants killed); Reuters (8 militants killed); AFP (5-8 suspected militants killed); CNN (3 suspected militants killed); BBC (at least 7 suspected militants killed); Xinhua (at least 8 people killed); SATP (8 suspected militants killed); Al Jazeera (5 people killed); Long War Journal (wrong strike).

⁸⁵ The News (earlier report citing 5-7 killed, as above); Reuters (as above); AFP (as above); CNN (as above); BBC (as above); Al Jazeera (3 people killed).

⁸⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike in al Qaeda haven of Datta Khel, The Long War Journal, May 12, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_strike_23.php.

⁸⁷ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 10 ‘militants’ in Mir Ali, The Long War Journal, May 16, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_killed_1.php#ixzz1QggDywQW; Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 6 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, May 20, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_kill_6_5.php.

LWJ: 7-8 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources

Conclusion: Weak identification of 7-8 militants killed. No identifying information other than some reports that they were “foreign” militants is available. The only source for identification as militants is anonymous officials. Two outlets, The News and AFP, provided updated reports, the News changing its figure from 5-7 to 7, AFP changing its figure from 5-8 to at least 7. In these circumstances we treat the lower reported figures as superseded.

27. May 13 2011

Doga Mada Khel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly targeted a moving vehicle. No civilians were reported killed. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 sources⁸⁸ and states that 3-5 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources⁸⁹ and states that 3-5 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites AFP/Dawn and states that 4 militants were killed.⁹⁰

Range of reported dead: 3-5

BIJ: 3-5 total

NAF: 3-5 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-5 militants killed. The only source is anonymous officials and there is no further identifying information.

28. May 16 2011

Mir Ali, North Waziristan

This strike attacked a building, reportedly a terrorist compound. Reuters reported: “An intelligence official said one of the dead militants, an Arab was the son of an al Qaeda operative identified as Abu Kashif.” The News also reports that all of those killed were allegedly foreigners. The News had earlier stated that there were reports that the senior Taliban leader of the Hafiz Gul Bahadar Group, Commander Haleem, was killed, but that Taliban sources and others in the region had denied this. No civilians were reported killed.

⁸⁸ The Nation (5 suspected militants killed); Al Jazeera (3 militants killed) (link repeated twice); weaselzipper.us (link to Long War Journal); Express Tribune/AFP (at least 3 suspected militants); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); Reuters (5 militants killed); Xinhua (at least 5 persons killed); Dawn/AFP (at least 4 militants killed); SATP (3 militants killed); Long War Journal.

⁸⁹ Express Tribune/AFP (as above); CNN (as above); Reuters (as above); Al Jazeera (as above).

⁹⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, May 13, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_strike_24.php#ixzz1QgjhpwZW.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 sources⁹¹ and states that 4-10 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 sources⁹² and states that 4-6 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites AFP/Dawn and The News, and states that 4 militants were killed.⁹³

Range of reported dead: 4-10

BIJ: 4-10 total

NAF: 4-6 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribesmen/local people (for figure of 4 killed and denial of death of Commander Haleem), Taliban sources (for denial of death of Commander Haleem only).

Conclusion: Total 4-10 killed. Weak identification of 3-9 militants killed. 1 militant is named but his death is unconfirmed. Only other identifying information is that those killed were “foreigners”, and only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials.

Although the figure of 7 dead reported in AP in August 2011 comes significantly after other reports, in this case we do not view this as superseding other reports, as the figure is mentioned in passing and without reference to any sources. The article also does not refer to the other strike that occurred on this day.

29. May 16 2011

Mir Ali, North Waziristan

No civilians were reported killed in this strike, which reportedly attacked a vehicle. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 4 sources⁹⁴ and states that 3-6 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 5 sources⁹⁵ and states that 3-6 militants were killed. The Long War Journal states that 6 militants were killed, but it is unclear what sources this figure is based on.⁹⁶

Range of reported dead: 3-6

BIJ: 3-6 total

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

⁹¹ AFP (6 militants killed); The News (4 people killed); The Nation (9 suspected militants killed); Dawn (4 militants killed); Xinhua (7 people killed); Reuters (12 killed including following strike); CNN (10 suspected militants killed); SATP (12 killed including following strike); Long War Journal; AP (7 suspected militants killed).

⁹² CNN (as above); AFP (as above); Dawn (as above); Reuters (as above).

⁹³ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 10 ‘militants’ in Mir Ali, The Long War Journal, May 16, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_killed_1.php.

⁹⁴ AFP (3 militants killed); The News (6 people killed); Dawn (3 militants killed); Reuters (12 people killed including former strike); SATP (12 people killed including former strike).

⁹⁵ AFP (as above); Dawn (as above); Reuters (as above). The other article, from CNN, refers only to the day’s earlier strike on a compound.

⁹⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 10 ‘militants’ in Mir Ali, The Long War Journal, May 16, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_killed_1.php.

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources/villagers

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-6 militants killed. No further identifying information, and the only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials.

30. May 20 2011

Tappi, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle. No civilians were reported killed. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cited 8 sources,⁹⁷ and reports 4-6 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources,⁹⁸ and states 4-6 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites Dawn/AFP and states that 6 militants were killed.⁹⁹

Range of reported dead: 4-6

BIJ: 4-6 total

NAF: 4-6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-6 militants killed. The only source is anonymous officials, and no identifying information is provided. Although one news source, AFP, provides a figure of 4 and a figure of 6 in separate reports, both were published on May 20 and it is not clear which one came later.

31. May 23 2011

Mir Ali, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle. AFP reports that those killed were allegedly “foreigners”. No civilians were reported killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 sources¹⁰⁰ and reports that 4-7 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources¹⁰¹ and states that 4-7 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites AFP and states that 7 militants were killed.¹⁰²

⁹⁷ Express Tribune (4 suspected militants killed); LA Times (link broken); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); Dawn/AFP (6 suspected militants killed); SATP (6 people killed); AFP (4 suspected militants); Xinhua (5 people killed); Long War Journal. The Express Tribune link is repeated twice.

⁹⁸ Reuters (6 militants killed); CNN (as above); Express Tribune (as above); Dawn (4 militants killed).

⁹⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 6 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, May 20, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_kill_6_5.php.

¹⁰⁰ AFP/Dawn (7 militants killed); Pakistan Observer (7 people killed); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); BBC (7 militants killed); Reuters (4 militants killed); AFP/Express Tribune (7 militants killed); The News (7 people killed); Xinhua (4 persons killed); Daily Times (7 terrorists killed); SATP (7 militants killed).

¹⁰¹ AP (6 alleged militants killed); AFP (4 militants killed); CNN (as above); BBC (as above); AFP/Express Tribune (as above); The News (as above).

¹⁰² Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in Mir Ali, The Long War Journal, May 23, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/05/us_predators_strike_25.php.

Range of reported dead: 4-7

BIJ: 4-7 total

NAF: 4-7 militants

LWJ: 7 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local sources

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-7 militants killed. Only source for identification as militants is anonymous officials, and only further identifying information is the claim that those killed were foreigners.

32. June 3 2011

Ghwa Khwa, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly targeted and killed Al Qaeda affiliate and senior commander of Harkat-ul Jihad al Islami and the 313 Brigade, Ilyas Kashmiri. This was the second time that Kashmiri was reported killed by a drone strike. A total of 9 members of his group were reportedly killed along with him, apparently as they rested in an orchard or in a compound owned by Mir Ajam Khan Tozihel. Five of those were named as Mohammad Usman, Ibrahim, Ustad Ahmad Farooq, Amir Hamza, and Imran, by Dawn and AFP. Later reports emerged suggesting that Kashmiri and Farooq were not killed, as reports indicated sightings of Kashmiri and videos were released featuring Farooq. The Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan had also initially denied his death. However on August 30, 2011, Asia Times reported that the 313 Brigade had appointed a new commander. On March 10, 2012, Al Qaeda released a video confirming Kashmiri's "martyrdom". On May 18, 2012, the UN Security Council updated its Al Qaeda list noting that Kashmiri was reported deceased.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists 27 sources,¹⁰³ and states that 8-9 people in total were killed, noting the identification of Kashmiri and 5 others by name. The New America Foundation cites 9 news sources,¹⁰⁴ and states that 9 militants were killed, including one militant leader (Kashmiri).

The Long War Journal, citing Xinhua and Samaa, initially reported that 5 militants were killed, although it notes initial reports that 9 militants including Kashmiri were killed.¹⁰⁵ It is difficult to

¹⁰³ Myfoxmemphis.com (link broken); Dawn (9 people killed, names Kashmiri and 5 others); AFP (9 people killed, names 3); Dawn; ht.ly.com (link broken); Long War Journal; NDTV; Reuters (Kashmiri and 5 close allies); Express Tribune/AFP (9 people killed); Indian Express (9 people killed, names 2); New York Times (9 people killed); LA Times (9 people killed); Wall Street Journal; BBC (9 people killed); Express Tribune (9 people killed); Dawn (repeat of earlier article); CNN (8 suspected militants killed); AFP; SATP (9 people killed); Asia Dispatch (link broken); Asia Times; The News; Daily News; Long War Journal; The Orange Tracker; Indian Express; United Nations Al Qaeda list.

¹⁰⁴ New York Times (as above); LA Times (as above); Wall Street Journal (as above); BBC (as above); Express Tribune (as above); Dawn (as above); Daily Times; CNN (as above); AFP (as above).

¹⁰⁵ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 5 'militants' in South Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, June 3, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predators_kill_5_6.php#ixzz1OIEuntDy.

tell whether the Journal updated its total figures, although a number of later articles discussed the ongoing controversy over Kashmiri's alleged death.¹⁰⁶

Range of reported dead: 5-9

BIJ: 8-9 total

NAF: 9 militants

LWJ: 5-9 militants

Sources: anonymous officials; residents/witnesses/locals; named tribesman (Alamgir, quoting the Taliban); spokesperson for Mullah Nazir (Lala Wazir); named officials (Shoaib Khan, Atifur Rehman, Naimat Ullah); Harkat-ul Jihad al Islami spokesperson Abu Hanzla;¹⁰⁷ anonymous Taliban; Al Qaeda; Pakistan's Interior Minister Rehman Malik; UN Security Council; US officials.

Conclusion: 9 militants killed, strong identification of 6 named militants killed, including leader Ilyas Kashmiri. Despite some controversy and confusion, evidence for Kashmiri's death is strong, particularly following the apparent confirmation from Al Qaeda. US officials, Pakistani officials, and the United Nations all appear to have accepted his death. We treat the death of Kashmiri as confirmed, and the deaths of the additional 5 named individuals as unconfirmed. The Long War Journal's early report of 5 killed was quickly superseded, and CNN's count of 8 killed was apparently before it was aware of Kashmiri's alleged death. In these circumstances, we are confident in the widely and later reported total figure of 9 killed.

33. June 6 2011

Shalam Raghzai, South Waziristan

The first of three strikes in South Waziristan on this day reportedly hit a house or a seminary. Officials are cited as stating that some of those who died in the three attacks were "foreigners". The New York Times quotes an official as saying there were "Arabs, Uzbeks, and at least 1 Turk." Officials quoted in the Nation state that 7 foreigners, 7 local fighters, and 9 Punjabi Taliban were killed over the day. CNN states that "witnesses told CNN affiliate Geo TV at the scene that among the dead were 7 civilians." Al Jazeera correspondent Kamal Hyder was also reported as saying that "there were concerns that civilians could have been among the dead." It is not clear which of the three strikes claims about the identity of the deceased relate to.

¹⁰⁶ Bill Roggio, Kashmiri is dead, al Qaeda spokesman suggests, The Long War Journal, March 16, 2012, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2012/03/kashmiri_is_dead_say.php; Bill Roggio, Al Qaeda leader Ilyas Kashmiri spotted at Taliban meeting, The Long War Journal, March 7, 2012, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2012/03/al_qaeda_leader_ilya.php; Bill Roggio, US intel believes Kashmiri killed in June Predator strike, The Long War Journal, July 7, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2012/03/al_qaeda_leader_ilya.php; Bill Ardolino and Bill Roggio, Questions emerge over HUIJ's statement on al Qaeda leader Ilyas Kashmiri's death, The Long War Journal, June 5, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/questions_emerge_ove.php.

¹⁰⁷ Doubts were later raised about this source, as a photo accompanying the statement turned out not to be Kashmiri, and there were some concerns that this was an attempt to fake Kashmiri's death.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 14 sources,¹⁰⁸ and states that 7-9 total were killed, including 7 civilians, in either this strike or the following strike.

The New America Foundation cites 7 sources¹⁰⁹ and states that 7-9 militants were killed.

The Long War Journal cites the New York Times and states that 18 militants were killed in the three strikes of the day, and appears to assume that they were all militants. The Journal cites Reuters for the claim that among those killed were 7 Punjabi Taliban. The Journal does not account for CNN's report of 7 civilian dead.¹¹⁰

Range of reported dead: 7-9

BIJ: 7-9 total (civilians counted in following strike)

NAF: 7-9 militants

LWJ: 7 militants [placeholder – The Journal's count for each strike is unclear, we use probable figures which bring the total for the three strikes up to the reported total of 18].

Sources: anonymous officials, witnesses (second-hand) (for claim of civilian deaths)

Conclusion: Weak identification of 7-9 militants killed. Only source for identification as militants is anonymous officials, although there is the additional identifying information of the deceased's alleged nationality and base. We count the 7 alleged civilian dead in the following strike.

34. June 6 2011

Wacha Dana, South Waziristan

The second strike of the day hit a compound or a seminary. The reports from the above strike regarding the identity of those killed, including the claim of 7 civilians killed, also apply to this strike.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 13 news sources,¹¹¹ and states that 8-10 total were killed, including 0-7 civilians. The New America Foundation cites 7 news sources¹¹² and states

¹⁰⁸ New York Times (14 people killed in the first 2 attacks); The Nation (at least 8 people killed); BBC (at least 18 people killed in 3 attacks); CNN (8-9 insurgents killed); Reuters (14 people killed in first 2 attacks); Express Tribune (7 militants killed); Geo TV (14 people killed in first 2 attacks); Al Jazeera (at least 19 people killed in 3 attacks); Time (link broken); Dawn/AFP (7 militants killed); Xinhua (7 people killed); Xinhua (7 people killed); Xinhua (total for first two strikes updated to 17 killed); SATP (7 terrorists killed).

¹⁰⁹ BBC (as above); CNN (as above); Reuters (as above); Express Tribune (as above); Geo TV (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); New York Times (as above).

¹¹⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike 3 targets in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, June 6, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predators_strike_26.php.

¹¹¹ The Nation (10 people killed); Express Tribune (8 militants killed); BBC (18 total killed in 3 strikes); CNN (8-9 insurgents killed); Reuters (14 killed in 2 strikes); Express Tribune (8 people implied killed); Geo TV (18 killed in 3 strikes); Al Jazeera (19 killed in 3 strikes); New York Times (at least 14 killed in 2 strikes); Time (link broken); Dawn/AFP (8 militants killed); Xinhua (12 killed, perhaps in 2 strikes); Reuters (18 killed in 3 strikes).

¹¹² BBC (as above); CNN (as above); Reuters (as above); Express Tribune (as above); Geo TV (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); New York Times (as above).

that 7-8 militants were killed. The Long War Journal, in the same article as above, states that 18 total were killed.

Range of reported dead: 8-10

BIJ: 8-10 total, 0-7 civilians

NAF: 7-8 militants

LWJ: 8 militants [placeholder – The Journal’s count for each strike is unclear, we use probable figures which bring the total for the three strikes up to the reported total of 18].

Sources: anonymous officials, witnesses (second-hand) (for claim of civilian deaths)

Conclusion: 8-10 total killed. Weak identification of 1-10 militants killed, 0-7 civilians killed. The identification of those killed as militants is based solely on anonymous officials, although some further identifying information is provided. The claim that those killed were civilians is based on “witnesses” referred to second-hand in one report (CNN) and no further information is provided. As such we take a lower figure of 0.

35. June 6 2011

Darnashtra, South Waziristan

The third and final strike of the day reportedly targeted a vehicle. The above noted reports that those killed were foreigners also applies to this strike. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 13 sources,¹¹³ and states that 3-5 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 7 news sources¹¹⁴ and states that 3-5 militants were killed. As noted above, The Long War Journal gives a total death count of 18 for all three strikes on this day.

Range of reported dead: 3-5

BIJ: 3-5 total

NAF: 3-5 total

LWJ: 3 militants [placeholder – The Journal’s count for each strike is unclear, we use probable figures which bring the total for the three strikes up to the reported total of 18].

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-5 militants killed. As with the above strikes, there is some identifying information, but the sole source for the claim that those killed were militants is anonymous officials.

36. June 8 2011

¹¹³ The Nation (5 suspected militants killed); Express Tribune (3 insurgents killed); BBC (18 killed in 3 strikes); CNN (implied 4 people killed); Reuters (3 militants killed); Express Tribune (4 people killed); Geo TV (at least 4 people killed); Al Jazeera (5 people killed); New York Times (at least 4 people killed); Time (link broken); Dawn/AFP (3 rebels killed); Xinhua (at least 4 people killed); Express Tribune.

¹¹⁴ BBC (as above); CNN (as above); Reuters (as above); Express Tribune (as above), Geo TV (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); New York Times (as above).

Shawal area, North or South Waziristan

The first of two strikes reportedly attacked a compound/camp in the forested Shawal Valley. AFP reports that “local residents described the camp as a major training center on the top of a hill...” According to officials cited by AFP, the camp was run by fighters loyal to Hafiz Gul Bahadar. Reports indicate that Punjabi fighters and foreigners (including Afghans) may have been among the dead.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists 8 sources,¹¹⁵ and states that 18-23 people were killed. The New America Foundation lists 5 news sources¹¹⁶ and states that 15-23 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites 2 sources¹¹⁷ and states that “more than 20” people were killed, including foreign fighters and Punjabi militants.¹¹⁸

Range of reported dead: 15-23

BIJ: 18-23 total

NAF: 15-23 militants

LWJ: 20 militants killed

Sources: anonymous officials, local residents, tribesmen

Conclusion: Medium identification of 15-23 militant dead. Claims by officials are somewhat corroborated by local residents, who state that the target was a training camp. Those killed are minimally identified as foreigners/Afghans/Punjabi militants loyal to Hafiz Gul Bahadar. Neither the Journal nor the Bureau adopted the lower figure of 15 killed, as reported by the BBC. The BBC itself states that officials said “the death toll may rise”, however it is not clear that the figure was superseded by other reports.

37. June 8 2011

Shawal, South Waziristan

The second strike of the day reportedly attacked a vehicle. This strike hit the vehicle in South Waziristan, close to the location of the first strike on the compound/camp. The reported identification of those killed as potentially foreign militants may also apply to this strike.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 5 news sources¹¹⁹ and states that 4 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 5 news sources¹²⁰ and states that 4 militants were

¹¹⁵ Reuters (18 militants killed); Xinhua (20 killed in 2 strikes); The News (24 killed in 2 strikes); New York Times (20 suspected militants killed in 2 strikes); Express Tribune (23 people killed); AFP (20 people killed); BBC (15 militants killed); SATP (24 militants killed in 2 strikes). The Reuters and Xinhua reports are listed twice.

¹¹⁶ Reuters (as above); AFP (as above); BBC (as above); New York Times (as above); AFP/Express Tribune (as above).

¹¹⁷ Dawn/AFP (at least 20 people killed); Geo TV (19 militants killed).

¹¹⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predators hit training camp, vehicle in North and South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, June 8, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predators_trainin.php.

¹¹⁹ Dawn/AFP (only discusses the first strike); New York Times (20 killed in 2 strikes); Reuters (4 militants killed); BBC; Xinhua (at least 20 killed in 2 strikes).

killed. The source for the upper figure of 5 is not clear, possibly coming from a broken link to AP. In the same article that discusses the earlier strike, the Long War Journal cites Reuters and states that 4 militants were killed. However it is not clear how this fits into the Journal's overall death count, as its individual counts of this strike (4) and the former (20) come to more than its apparent total count for the day (22).

Range of reported dead: 4

BIJ: 4 total

NAF: 4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4 militants killed. Only source for identification as militants is anonymous officials, although there is some further reported identifying information.

38. June 15 2011

Wana, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly attacked a building or compound and a vehicle. Reuters reports that officials stated the compound belonged to a group headed by Maulvi Nazir. The Long War Journal counts the strike against the compound and the vehicle separately, while New America and the Bureau have counted it as one strike. This is somewhat confusing as the Bureau also lists a second strike on June 15 in South Waziristan, a strike in Karez that killed no people.¹²¹

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 5 sources¹²² and states that 9-10 people were killed. Chris Woods from the Bureau told us that the lower figure of 9 is based on a Dawn report. The link to the report is now dead, however Mr. Woods provided us with the saved text of the report. New America cites 6 news sources, and states that 4-10 militants were killed.¹²³ The lower figure of 4 appears to reflect a possibility that there was not a second strike. The Long War Journal cites 2 news sources¹²⁴ and states that 7 militants were killed in the compound, 3 in the vehicle.¹²⁵

Range of reported dead: 10-11

¹²⁰ Reuters (as above); AFP (as above); BBC (as above); New York Times (as above); AFP/Express Tribune (as above).

¹²¹ While none of the active links listed by the Bureau discuss this strike, Chris Woods provided us with the saved text of the Pak Tribune article, and a link to an additional article from the News which both account for the strike.

¹²² Pak Tribune (link broken); CNN (10 militants killed); Express Tribune/Reuters (10 militants killed); AP/boston.com (10 militants killed); SATP (10 militants killed). A link to Dawn is broken and acknowledged as such.

¹²³ CNN (as above); Express Tribune (as above); AFP (4 militants killed in the vehicle); Dawn (18 killed in three strikes); AP (as above); BBC (4 militants killed in the vehicle).

¹²⁴ AP (link broken); The News (10 militants killed).

¹²⁵ Bill Roggio, US Predator strike kills 15 'militants' in South and North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, June 15, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predator_strike_k_9.php.

BIJ: 9-10 total

NAF: 4-10 militants

LWJ: 7 + 3 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, residents

Conclusion: Medium identification of 10-11 militants killed. The alleged connection with Maulvi Nazir provides some very limited identifying information, and there are two sources to support the claim. As we cannot access the original report on which the lower figure of 9 is based, in our view it is not appropriate for us to include the figure in our own count.

39. June 15 2011

Miranshah, North Waziristan

This strike hit a vehicle. Anonymous officials stated that those killed were militants. However Dawn and The News report that the attack sparked protests against the killing of innocent people, with locals blocking roads with four of the victims' coffins. According to Dawn, more than 2000 tribesmen participated in the protest and the victims' funeral.

Reprieve has filed a complaint with the Human Rights Council on behalf of the family members of victims of this strike, and identifies those killed as Akram Shah, an employee of the Water Resources & Power Development Authority (and according to The News and Dawn, the driver of the car); Atiq ur Rehman (also known as Tariq), a pharmacist; Irshad Khan, an employee of Mr. Rehman; and Amar Khan, a student at Miranshah college. Between them, Dawn and The News also identify Akram Shah and Tariq as among the dead, and also names Umar Khan, who owned an auto spare-parts shop, and Shazada, a student. They state that three of the victims belonged to the Borakhel tribe, and another from Torikhel tribe.

Chris Woods of the Bureau of Investigative Journalism noted that Amar Khan and Umar Khan are probably the same person, as they are local spelling variations of the same name. On the other hand, they are stated to have different occupations, so in our view it is not clear whether they are the same person.

The Bureau also undertook independent investigation in this case, noting that the family of one of the victims, Shahzada, had moved to Peshawar due to fear of the local Taliban, calling further into question reports that those killed were militants.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists 10 sources,¹²⁶ and states that 5-6 civilians were killed. Relying on its sources and its own investigators, the Bureau names 5 of those killed, not including Umar Khan (for the reason stated above).

The New America Foundation lists six news sources, and states that 3-5 militants were killed.¹²⁷

¹²⁶ Pak Tribune (link broken); Dawn (6 people killed); The News (4 dead identified); CNN (5 militants killed); AP/boston.com (5 militants killed); AFP (at least 4 militants killed); BBC (3 people killed); Dawn (8 people killed); SATP (8 people killed); Reprieve.

¹²⁷ CNN (as above); AFP (as above); Dawn (as above); AP (as above); BBC (as above). One source, Express Tribune, refers only to the day's previous strike.

Relying on a now dead link to Dawn, the Long War Journal states that 5 militants were reported killed.¹²⁸ However, in its second report on the strike on June 17, Dawn reports the protests and identifies 4 out of 5-6 dead civilians. This is in contrast to its report the day before, stating that 8 suspected militants were killed.

Range of reported dead: 3-8

BIJ: 5-6 total, 5-6 civilians

NAF: 3-5 militants

LWJ: 5 militants

Sources: For the claim that those killed were militants: anonymous officials. For the claim that those killed were civilians: residents/tribesmen; victims' legal filing; Bureau investigation.

Conclusion: Total 5-6 civilians killed. Strong identification of 5 civilians killed (assuming that Umar and Amar Khan are the same person). The claim that those killed were militants is based solely on anonymous officials with no additional identifying information. In contrast, the identification of those killed as civilians is supported by names, occupations, and tribes. The individual identification of 3 of those killed is corroborated by two independent sources.¹²⁹ The protests reportedly sparked by the strike, and the flight of Shahzada's family to Peshawar are also circumstantial evidence supporting the claim that those killed were civilians.

Further evidence that those killed were civilians is provided in *Living Under Drones*, a report by the Human Rights Law Clinics at NYU and Stanford law schools, which interviewed relatives of the deceased and community members who knew them.¹³⁰

40. June 20 2011 (3 strikes)

Khardand, Kurram

Three strikes reportedly attacked a vehicle and two buildings or compounds in Kurram Agency. Reportedly among the dead were 6-9 Afghan militants believed to be linked to the Haqqani Network. This is one of very few drone strikes outside of North or South Waziristan. As many of the reports provide a death count figure only for all strikes together, and other reports appear to only account for two of the three strikes without making it clear which ones, it is very difficult to provide individual death counts. For that reason, although it appears that there were three strikes with different targets, we count them together here.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites a total of 12 sources.¹³¹ For the first strike on the vehicle, it states that 7 people were killed, including 2-7 civilians. The civilian death count is

¹²⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predator strike kills 15 'militants' in South and North Waziristan, *The Long War Journal*, June 15, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predator_strike_k_9.php.

¹²⁹ Akram Shah (Reprieve, Dawn/The News); Atiq ur Rehman/Tariq (Reprieve, Dawn/The News); Shahzada (Dawn/The News, Bureau).

¹³⁰ NYU Center for Human Rights and Global Justice & Stanford International Human Rights Clinic, *Living Under Drones* 62-66 (2012), available at www.livingunderdrones.org.

¹³¹ Voice of America (11 militants in 2 strikes); AP/boston.com (12 militants in 2 strikes); The Nation (11 militants in 3 strikes); Daily Times; AFP (6 militants in 2 strikes); CNN (7 alleged militants in 2 strikes); BBC (6 suspected militants); Reuters (11 militants in 3 strikes); Huffington Post (12 people in 2 strikes);

based on information from the Bureau's researchers in Waziristan. The second strike on a house is reported to have killed 3-5 people. The Bureau also notes a potential third strike on a compound killing 5 people, but this figure is not included in the Bureau's count. This gives a total of 10-12 killed, including 2-7 civilians

The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources.¹³² It states that 5-7 militants were killed in the first strike on a vehicle and/or compound, and 2-7 militants were killed in the second strike on a compound. This gives a total death count of 7-14 militants.

The Long War Journal cites Dawn and provides a total death count of 11 fighters.¹³³

Range of reported dead: 6-12

BIJ: 10-12 total, 2-7 civilians

NAF: 7-14 militants

LWJ: 11 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local government official Noor Alam, Bureau investigation

Conclusion: 11-12 total dead, including 2-7 civilians, 4-10 militants. Those reports which explicitly account for 3 strikes (The Nation and Reuters) provide a total count of 11. Other reports account for 2 strikes, but may be including the first compound in the same count as the vehicle strike. If not, it is not clear which strike they refer to when they mention a strike on a compound. These reports provide a range of 6-12. While 12 pushes the upper figure higher, the figures lower than 11 can be discarded as it appears they are not counting one of the strikes. There is medium identification of the victims as militants. A named government official supports the claim that those killed are militants, and additional identifying information (that they were Afghans linked to Haqqani network) is provided.

41. June 27 2011

Shawal, North or South Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a truck or trucks close to the border between North and South Waziristan. Reports indicate that 3 foreigners and 5 local Taliban were among the dead. The Express Tribune also reports that the deceased were believed to be from Hafiz Gul Bahadar's group. The Pakistan Observer reports that local sources said there were no reports stating if those killed were militants, and residents feared locals were killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 7 sources¹³⁴ and states that 6-12 people were killed. The New America Foundation lists 8 sources¹³⁵ and states that 3-12 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites Reuters, and states that 8 militants were killed.¹³⁶

Al Jazeera (9 suspected fighters in 2 strikes); Xinhua (11 suspected militants in 2 strikes); Long War Journal.

¹³² AFP (as above); CNN (as above); BBC (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); Reuters (as above); AP (as above).

¹³³ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike the Haqqani Network in Kurram, The Long War Journal, June 20, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predators_strike_27.php.

Range of reported dead: 3-12

BIJ: 6-12 total

NAF: 3-12 militants

LWJ: 8 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, residents/local sources

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-12 militants killed. Although the BBC's lower figure of 3 appears to be an outlier, it is dated the day after the strike and it is not clear it has been superseded. The sole source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials, although some additional identifying information is provided (that there were foreigners and local Taliban, and with an alleged connection to Hafiz Gul Bahadar).

42. June 27 2011

Mantoi, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly attacked a compound/training camp. Dawn and AFP report that those killed were local Taliban fighters, and BBC reports that the compound was being used by Hakimullah Mehsud's Tehrik-e Taliban Pakistan. Dawn reports that the compound was owned by commander Adam Khan, and Pajhwok reports that he was the target. Although officials state that all of those killed were militants, Pajhwok reports that a resident of the area, Hajji Malak Dildar, stated that 20 civilians were killed and several others injured.

The Bureau cites 9 sources and states that 14-21 people were killed.¹³⁷ While a number of reports provide figures of 12-13, in its second report on the strike on June 28, Xinhua updated the death count to 14.

The New America Foundation cites 8 sources¹³⁸ and states that 12-21 militants were killed. New America had originally included Pajhwok in its list of sources, but had not accounted for its claim of civilian deaths. The reference to Pajhwok has now been deleted.

The Long War Journal cites Reuters and states that 13 militants were killed.¹³⁹

¹³⁴ Al Jazeera (8 fighters killed); Pak Observer (8 suspected militants killed); The News (6 people killed); Express Tribune (12 militants killed); BBC (3 people killed); Xinhua (incorrect link); Xinhua (12 people killed).

¹³⁵ CNN (6 suspected militants killed); Geo TV (6 people killed); Reuters (8 militants killed); Al Jazeera (as above); Express Tribune (as above); AP (8 suspected militants killed); BBC (as above); AFP (12 Taliban killed).

¹³⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 21 in South Waziristan strikes, The Long War Journal, June 27, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predators_kill_13_1.php.

¹³⁷ Dawn (13 local Taliban killed); AFP (12 local Taliban killed); Pak Observer (21 people killed); The News (21 people killed); Al Jazeera (13 people confirmed killed); Express Tribune (14 people killed); BBC (12 people killed); Xinhua (at least 13 people killed); Xinhua (14 people killed). The Dawn article is listed twice.

¹³⁸ CNN (13 people killed); Geo TV (21 people killed); Reuters (13 militants killed); Al Jazeera (as above); Express Tribune (as above); AP (12 suspected militants killed); AFP (as above); BBC (as above).

¹³⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 21 in South Waziristan strikes, The Long War Journal, June 27, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/06/us_predators_kill_13_1.php.

Range of reported dead: 12-21

BIJ: 14-21 total, 0-20 civilians

NAF: 12-21 militants

LWJ: 13 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, resident Hajji Malak Dildar

Conclusion: 14-21 total dead. 0-21 militants killed, and 0-20 civilians killed, as it is not clear whether those killed were militants or civilians. There is a single source, a named resident, for the claim that those killed were civilians. The sole source for the claim that those killed were militants is anonymous officials, although some further identifying information is provided (that Commander Adam Khan and the compound of Hakimullah Mehsud's Terik-e Taliban were targeted, that those killed were local Taliban).

43. July 5 2011

Mir Ali, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a guest house. According to Xinhua, the Long War Journal, and the Bureau's researchers in Waziristan, Australian convert and militant Saifullah was among those killed. The Bureau's researchers state that "Saifullah, the Australian national, happened to be a guest of Zahirullah, who owned a general store in Mir Ali bazaar, and both were killed... There was no doubt about Saifullah's background. He was a white Australian convert, who had grown a beard and used to rotate between North Waziristan and Khost. Sources said he used to fight against the US-led forces in Khost province in Afghanistan and then return to North Waziristan for rest." The Bureau reports that the Australian government continues to deny that one of its citizens was killed.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 9 sources¹⁴⁰ and states that 4-6 people were killed.

The New America Foundation cites 4 sources and states that 3-4 militants were killed.¹⁴¹ It is not clear why New America does not account for the upper reported figure of 6 people killed – this upper figure is provided by Express Tribune, but New America's record of Express Tribune's count states that only 4 were reported killed. New America also does not refer to the reported death of Saifullah.

The Long War Journal cites Reuters and AFP and states that at least 4 militants were killed.¹⁴²

Range of reported dead: 3-6

¹⁴⁰ AFP (4-6 militants killed); PTI/Outlook Indian (4 militants killed); People's Daily (at least 6 people killed); Pakistan Observer (6 suspected militants); Mangalorean (4 people killed); Long War Journal; Xinhua (6 people killed); CNN (3 people killed); Times of India (4 suspected militants).

¹⁴¹ BBC (at least 4 militants killed); Reuters (4 militants killed); AFP/Express Tribune (4-6 militants killed); CNN (as above).

¹⁴² Bill Roggio, US Predators strike terrorist 'guesthouse' in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, July 5, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/07/us_predators_strike_28.php. See also Bill Roggio, Australian al Qaeda commander reported killed in Predator strike, Threat Matrix, The Long War Journal, July 6, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/threat-matrix/archives/2011/07/australian_al_qaeda_commander.php#ixzz1RPPHa8vW.

BIJ: 4-6 total

NAF: 3-4 militants killed

LWJ: 4 militants killed

Sources: anonymous officials, Bureau investigation

Conclusion: Identification of 1 named militant killed, weak identification of 3-5 militants killed. Total of 4-6 killed. One militant, Saifullah, is named in reports and by the Bureau's investigators. The Bureau also names the owner of the guesthouse, although it notes that there is debate over his militant links. The only other source for the identification of those killed as militants is anonymous officials, who state that foreign militants were among the dead. We discard the lower figure of 3, which is reported only by CNN in one of the earlier reports which does not report on Saifullah's death.

44. July 11 2011

Gurwak, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle. The News states that those killed were reportedly Afghan and foreign fighters.

The Bureau cites 11 new sources,¹⁴³ and stated that 5-10 people were killed, including 0-5 civilians. Chris Woods told us that the potential civilian count is based on an indication of collateral damage from Geo TV, which reported that officials expressed ignorance about the identity of the deceased.

The New America Foundation counts this strike and the following strike together. As such while New America does account for this attack, we include all of their figures in the following entry.

Citing AP, the Long War Journal counts this strike and the following strike on a compound together, stating that 12 militants were killed in total for both strikes.¹⁴⁴

Range of reported dead: 5-10

BIJ: 5-10 total, 0-5 civilians

NAF: 0

LWJ: 5 [placeholder to bring total for this strike and the following one up to 12]

Sources: anonymous officials, Taliban sources.

Conclusion: Medium identification of 5-7 militants killed. Identification of deceased as militants reportedly supported by "Taliban sources" according to The News. The count is confused, however we do not include the upper figure of 10. Early figures counting this strike and the

¹⁴³ The News (25 people killed in 2 strikes); The News (5 people killed); AFP (at least 10 people killed in 2 strikes); Dawn/AFP (at least 10 people killed in 2 strikes); AP/Washington Times (appears to only refer to the following strike); Pakwatan (5 people killed); AP/stltoday.com (wrong link); AP/MSNBC (appears to only refer to the following strike); Geo News (5 people killed); Reuters (25 suspected insurgents killed in 2 strikes); BBC (7 people killed). An additional link to Dawn is acknowledged as broken.

¹⁴⁴ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 12 'militants' in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, July 11, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/07/us_predators_kill_12.php.

following strike together provide a figure of 10, and none of the reports cited themselves stand by this figure solely for the vehicle strike. In our view, reports indicating that the identity of the deceased is not known are not sufficient to amount to reports of civilian deaths.

45. July 11 2011

Gurwak, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly attacked a compound. Virtually all listed reports provide a total death count that includes the previous strike. Three sources appear to only refer to a compound, but their figures are consistent with counts for both the compound and the vehicle strikes.¹⁴⁵

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists the same sources as for the previous strike, and states that 12-25 people were killed.

The New America Foundation lists 7 news sources¹⁴⁶ and states that 7-25 militants were killed in both this strike and the previous one. Where some news outlets have reported on only one of the day's strikes, New America appears to treat this as evidence that any additional strikes did not happen. This appears to be the cause of the particularly low bottom figure in this case, which accounts for only one strike.

As noted above, the Long War Journal states that a total of 12 militants were killed in this strike and the previous one.

Range of reported dead: 10-25

BIJ: 12-25 total

NAF: 7-25 militants

LWJ: 7 militants [placeholder to bring total for this strike and the previous one up to 12]

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, Taliban sources.

Conclusion: Medium identification of 18-20 militants killed. In our view, the total figure of 25 killed in this strike and the previous strike, as reported by The News and Reuters/Express Tribune on July 13, supersedes earlier counts. Reports providing lower counts were all published earlier, including earlier reports from The News. In reports providing lower counts, it was also noted that "officials said the number of casualties could rise as the area of the drone strike had been completely destroyed."¹⁴⁷ The figure of 25 total is also supported by "Taliban sources". We reach the figure of 18-20 by subtracting the death count of the previous strike.

46. July 12 2011

Barmal, South Waziristan

¹⁴⁵ AP/Washington Times (12 alleged militants killed); Pakwatan (25 people killed); AP/MSNBC (12 alleged militants killed).

¹⁴⁶ The News (25 militants killed in 2 strikes); Express Tribune/Reuters (25 suspected insurgents killed in 2 strikes); CNN (10 killed); AFP (12-16 militants killed); Daily Times (25 killed); Guardian (20-23 killed); BBC (7 killed).

¹⁴⁷ Dawn/AFP.

This strike reportedly hit a compound, although some reports state that it hit a vehicle. Officials state that those killed were militants. The News reports that local and foreign militants and Punjabi militants were allegedly among those killed. Pakistan Today reports that 5 youngsters associated with the Haqqani Network, including three named as Hafiz Bilal, Waheedullah, and Fayeze, were among those killed.¹⁴⁸ Reports state that Bilal worked closely with the Haqqani Network, but Digital Journal reports that:

... a statement published in the Urdu daily Ausaf (Saturday, July 16, 2011) describes Bilal as an innocent, intelligent student who had countless good qualities and who devoted all his time to his studies. The statement comes from Bilal's teacher and the chairman of the university's Department of Geology, Dr. Fazli-Rabbi Khan.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 13 news sources¹⁴⁹ and states that 5-13 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources¹⁵⁰ and also states that 5-13 people were killed. The Long War Journal cites Samaa and a broken link to Dawn, and states that 8 suspected militants were killed.¹⁵¹

Range of reported dead: 5-13

BIJ: 5-13 total

NAF: 5-13 militants

LWJ: 8 suspected militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, statement by one victim's teacher (second-hand report)

Conclusion: Medium identification of 5-13 militants killed, according to both anonymous officials and tribal sources. Those killed are identified as local, foreign, and Punjabi militants. Five are identified as young people associated with the Haqqani Network, and three of those are identified by name. However, they are not militant leaders and their connection to any militancy is unclear. Although the statement by Bilal's teacher describes him as "innocent", we do not count him as a civilian as in our view the statement does not clearly counter claims that he worked closely with the Haqqani Network. We do not know the substance of the "militant links" the young people allegedly had, or whether those links would justify lethally targeting them.

47. July 12 2011

Bray Nishtar, North Waziristan

¹⁴⁸ It is not completely clear which of the July 12 strikes they were allegedly killed in.

¹⁴⁹ Digital Journal; Pakistan Today; The News (8 people killed); Pakwatan (6 people killed); AP/stltoday.com (wrong link); Geo News (6 people killed); BBC (10 people killed); The News (repeated link); AFP (13 people killed); Pakwatan (repeated link); Geo News (repeated link); Reuters (5 suspected militants killed); BBC (repeated link). Links to Dawn and Lahore Times are acknowledged as broken.

¹⁵⁰ The News (8 people killed); Reuters/Express Tribune (5 suspected militants killed); AFP (as above); Daily Times (5 suspected militants killed); The Guardian (10 militants killed); BBC (as above).

¹⁵¹ Bill Roggio, Predators kill 8 in South Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, July 12, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/07/predators_kill_8_in.php.

This strike reportedly hit a compound, or a compound and a vehicle. Officials claim that those killed were militants, and the Asian Tribune reports that “According to sources, a tribesman, identified as Rahim Noor, having links with militant groups owned the compound.” The News reports that tribesmen claim that local villagers were killed. The Bureau’s own researchers report that the drones returned and attacked rescuers, killing 4 Taliban and 4 civilians, whom the Bureau names as Shabbir, Kalam, Waqas and Bashir.

The Bureau cites 5 sources¹⁵² and states that 13-14 people were killed, including 4 civilians. The New America Foundation also cites 5 sources,¹⁵³ and states that 8-15 militants were killed. It does not provide for the possibility of civilian deaths. The Long War Journal does not appear to have reported on this strike.

Range of reported dead: 8-25

BIJ: 13-15 total, 4 civilians

NAF: 8-15 militants

LWJ: 0

Sources: anonymous officials, tribesmen, Bureau investigation

Conclusion: Total 8-15 people killed, 4 civilians, 4-11 militants. Strong identification of 4 militants, whose identity is corroborated by independent investigation. The civilians are identified strongly by name. The claim that the target was a militant compound is also supported by alleged claims from tribesmen. We throw out the upper number of 25 reported by Press TV. In the circumstances, it seems very likely that the figure includes deaths from a number of strikes.

48. July 12 2011

Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle, and according to the Bureau’s researchers in Waziristan, it was directed at the New Adda (new public stand) in Dattakhel town. The Bureau’s researchers also report that 8 suspected militants, all Pakistanis from local tribes, were killed in the attack. They state that a civilian named Abdul Jalil, a migrant worker in the UAE who was on leave, was killed. The News reports that “Both official and tribal sources said a local villager driving his personal car came under drone attack.”

The Bureau cites the same sources as above¹⁵⁴ and states that 8-9 people were killed, including 1 civilian. The New America Foundation cites 3 sources¹⁵⁵ and states that 3-8 militants were killed. The Long War Journal does not appear to have reported on this strike.

Range of reported dead: 1-6

¹⁵² The News (16 killed in 2 strikes); Pakistan Times (8 people killed); Press TV (25 suspects killed); The Nation (at least 10 suspected militants killed); Asian Tribune (7 suspected militants killed).

¹⁵³ Express Tribune (15 militants killed); CNN (13 killed); Daily Times (15 militants killed); BBC (at least 13 people killed); The Guardian (8-13 alleged militants killed).

¹⁵⁴ Not all of these provide an explicit count for this strike. Those that do are: The News (at least 1 person killed); Press TV (at least 6 suspected militants killed).

¹⁵⁵ Reuters/Express Tribune (3 militants killed); Daily Times (3 people killed); CNN (8 people killed).

BIJ: 8-9 total, including 1 civilian

NAF: 3-8 militants

LWJ: 0

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, Bureau investigation.

Conclusion: 6-9 total killed, 1 civilian strongly identified (by name) as killed, 5-8 militants killed. Medium identification of 0-3 militants killed, strong identification of 5 militants killed as reports are corroborated by Bureau's investigation. The civilian is named by the Bureau, and the report of his death is consistent with the claims of official and tribal sources reported by The News.

49. July 20 2011

Mir Ali, North Waziristan

According to locals, this strike hit a house killing 4 people. Press Trust of India (PTI)/MSN News describes those killed as "suspected militants", although there is no clear source for this claim. PTI/MSN News also notes that "There was no official word on this incident."

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 3 news sources¹⁵⁶ and states that 4 people were killed. Neither the New America Foundation nor the Long War Journal appear to count this strike.

Range of reported dead: 4

BIJ: 4 total

NAF: 0

LWJ: 0

Sources: locals

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4 militants killed, as the original source for their identification as suspected militants is not clear, and no other information is provided.

50. August 1 2011

Azam Warsak, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly targeted a moving vehicle. Officials state that those killed were militants. Pajhwok reports that according to Wana based political administration official Shoaib Wazir, they were local Taliban. However a resident of the area, Riaz Gul "alleged the dead were civilians, with no links to the Taliban." An elder from Barmal, Haji Abdul Wahab Dawar, stated that 2 houses were also damaged in the strike.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 5 news sources¹⁵⁷ and states that 4-6 people were killed, including 0-6 civilians. The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources¹⁵⁸ and states

¹⁵⁶ Express Tribune (4 people killed); Press TV (at least 4 people killed); PTI/MSN News (at least 4 suspected militants killed).

that 3-6 militants were killed. New America initially included the Pajhwok report in its list of sources, but did not incorporate the allegation of civilian deaths. New America has since deleted the reference to Pajhwok. The lower figure of 3 also appears to be incorrect. The basis of the figure is a Dawn article, however the figure of 3 appears only in a picture caption – the article states that 4 people were killed. The Long War Journal cites AFP and states that 4 militants were killed.¹⁵⁹

Range of reported dead: 4-6

BIJ: 4-6 total, 0-6 civilians

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, named official (Shoaib Wazir), local resident (Riaz Gul), local elder (Haji Abdul Wahab Dawar).

Conclusion: 4-6 total killed, 0-6 militants, 0-6 civilians. Officials identify those killed as militants, and one named official identifies them specifically as local Taliban. However this is not enough to disprove the claim of a local resident that all of those killed were civilians. We therefore account for both possibilities.

51. August 2 2011

Qutab Khel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a moving vehicle. Officials stated that those killed were militants, while villagers described them as “local tribesmen.” The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 3 news sources¹⁶⁰ and states that 3-4 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources.¹⁶¹ New America’s dataset puts the number of dead at 4, but its sources document states 3-4 militants were killed. As 3-4 is the number reflected in New America’s actual sources, we assume that this is the correct entry. The Long War Journal cites a broken link to AP and states that 4 militants were killed.¹⁶²

Range of reported dead: 3-4

BIJ: 3-4 total

NAF: 3-4 militants

¹⁵⁷ AFP (4 militants killed); AFP/Express Tribune (at least 4 militants killed); Reuters/Dawn (at least 4 suspected militants killed); The News (at least 5 people killed); Dawn (4 militants killed).

¹⁵⁸ CNN (6 alleged militants killed); Pajhwok (5 suspected militants or civilians killed); New York Times/AP (link broken); Dawn (as above); AFP/Express Tribune (as above); The News (as above).

¹⁵⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 4 ‘militants’ in South Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, August 1, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/us_predators_kill_4_6.php.

¹⁶⁰ Voice of America (4 militants killed); The News (3 people killed); AP (apparently wrong article). An additional link to AFP is acknowledged as broken.

¹⁶¹ AFP/Express Tribune (4 militants killed); Dawn/AP (4 alleged militants killed); The News (3 people killed); Daily Times (4 terrorists killed).

¹⁶² Bill Roggio, US Predators strike in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, August 2, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/us_predators_strike_29.php.

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources and villagers

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-4 militants killed. The only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials, and there is no further identifying information.

52. August 10 2011

Miramshah, North Waziristan

This attack reportedly struck a Haqqani Network compound and a vehicle. A number of reports including from BBC and Reuters/The Guardian state that the dead included local Taliban, Arabs, and Uzbek nationals. All of the dead were reported to be part of the Haqqani Network.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 5 news sources¹⁶³ and states that 20-25 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources¹⁶⁴ and states that 18-23 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites AFP and Reuters and states that 21 militants were killed.¹⁶⁵

Range of reported dead: 18-25

BIJ: 20-25 total

NAF: 18-23 militants

LWJ: 21 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local journalists, residents, AP investigation

Conclusion: Total 20-25 killed. Strong identification of 20 militants killed (corroborated by AP), medium identification of additional 1-4 militants killed. Official claims that those killed were militants is supported somewhat by local residents, and by the AP's independent investigation. AP's February 2012 investigation stated that at least 20 people were killed, and we take this as our lower figure. Lower death counts had already been superseded in the reports, which noted that the official death toll had risen to 21 after more bodies were pulled from the rubble.

53. August 16 2011

Miramshah, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a house in or near the market and near a girls' school. There are conflicting reports on the identity of those killed, with AP reporting that "officials say initial reports indicate 2 foreigners were among the dead, but their precise nationalities were not known." In contrast, the News reports that "Residents said all slain men were local tribal militants." The Nation, and the News in an earlier report, state that a child and 2 women were

¹⁶³ Dawn (18 people killed); Reuters/The Guardian (21 suspected militants killed); Al Jazeera (23 suspected militants killed); PTI/Deccan Herald (at least 25 militants killed); AP (link broken, but referring to independent investigation identifying at least 20 Afghan and Pakistani Taliban fighters killed). A link to the Washington Post is acknowledged as broken.

¹⁶⁴ Dawn (as above); Al Jazeera (as above); Reuters/The Guardian (as above); BBC (at least 21 militants killed); Telegraph (up to 21 suspected militants killed); Express Tribune (21-25 militants killed).

¹⁶⁵ Bill Roggio, US Predators target Haqqani fighters in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, August 9, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/us_predators_kill_7_3.php/.

amongst the dead. An intelligence official cited in South Asia News stated that 3 women and one child were amongst the dead.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 9 news sources,¹⁶⁶ and states that 4 people were killed, including 3-4 civilians, including a child. The New America Foundation cites 5 news sources¹⁶⁷ and states that 4 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites AFP and states that 4 militants and no civilians were killed.¹⁶⁸

Range of reported dead: 4

BIJ: 4 total, 3-4 civilians

NAF: 4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local residents

Conclusion: 4 total killed, 0-4 militants, 0-4 civilians. There are conflicting accounts of the identity of those killed, with some officials and residents stating that those killed were militants. However reports conflicted on whether the militants were local or foreign. This conflicted again with reports that 2-3 women and 1 child were amongst the dead. In our view, no particular identification appears to supersede the others. We note that the Bureau of Investigative Journalism took a different view on this matter. Chris Woods told us that the origin of the report of civilian deaths in the Nation and South Asia News is an intelligence officer, which in the Bureau's opinion is rare and particularly credible.¹⁶⁹

54. August 19 2011

Shin Warsak, South Waziristan

The Nation, The News and Geo TV report that this strike hit a house owned by Ahmed Noor. In a later report, The News reports that the house belonged to Muhammad Nauroz, a local tribesmen belonging to the Karmazhel Wazir tribe. The News states that while some reports said the deceased were foreign, tribal sources "insisted that they were local tribesmen."

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 10 sources¹⁷⁰ and states that 3-4 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 4 news sources¹⁷¹ and states that 4 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites 2 news sources¹⁷² and states that 4 militants were killed.¹⁷³

¹⁶⁶ AFP/Dawn (at least 4 militants killed); AFP/MSN (at least 4 militants killed); AP/Khaleej Times (4 militants killed); BBC (4 militants killed); Voice of America (4 suspected militants killed); Al Jazeera (at least 4 fighters killed); The News (4 people killed); The Nation (4 people killed); South Asia News/Monsters & Critics (at least 4 people killed). Links to Wall Street Journal and SANA are acknowledged as broken.

¹⁶⁷ Al Jazeera (as above); Daily Times (4 militants killed); Dawn/AFP (as above); BBC (as above); The News (4 people killed).

¹⁶⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 4 'militants' in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, August 15, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/us_predators_kill_4_7.php.

¹⁶⁹ We note that the original source of the Nation report is not clear on the face of the article.

¹⁷⁰ Press TV (at least 4 people killed); Dawn (at least 2 people killed); AFP/Hindustan Times (at least 4 militants killed); South Asia Times/Monsters & Critics (at least 4 people killed); The Nation (4 people

Range of reported dead: 2-4

BIJ: 3-4 total

NAF: 4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local residents/tribal sources

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-4 militants killed. The only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials. While the deceased are further identified as foreigners according to reports of reports, this is disputed by local residents. The lower figure of 2 is discarded, as it appears in only one of the earlier reports. The lower figure of three appears once but in one of the latest reports, and the second report on the strike by The News.

55. August 22 2011

Norwak, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle, and some reports say it also hit a guesthouse. On August 27, US officials were reported as saying that alleged Al Qaeda no. 2, Atiyah abd al-Rahman, had been killed on August 22. US officials would not initially say how al-Rahman was killed, although it was widely speculated that he was killed in a drone strike, and later reports including by the Long War Journal cited US officials as saying this was the cause of death. While there was initially some uncertainty surrounding al-Rahman's alleged death,¹⁷⁴ it was later confirmed by Al Qaeda.¹⁷⁵

A number of reports cite anonymous officials for the claim that all of those killed were suspected militants. However, Dawn reports that 7 people were killed of which only 3 were militants, and 4 were tribesmen from the same family. Dawn also reports that the vehicle and home were owned by tribesmen Gul Sawab.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 21 sources,¹⁷⁶ and states that 4-7 people were killed. In light of the Dawn report, the Bureau states that 0-4 civilians may also have been killed.

killed); AFP/Express Tribune (at least 4 suspected militants killed); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); The Nation (at least 4 suspected persons killed); The News (3 people killed); IRNA (link broken).

¹⁷¹ AFP/Express Tribune (as above); CNN (as above); Dawn (as above); The News (at least 4 people killed).

¹⁷² Geo TV (at least 4 people killed); AFP/Samaa (at least 4 suspected militants killed).

¹⁷³ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, August 19, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/us_predators_strike_30.php.

¹⁷⁴ Bill Roggio, Al Qaeda releases Ramadan tape by Atiyah Abd al Rahman, The Long War Journal, August 30, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/al_qaeda_releases_ra.php.

¹⁷⁵ Bill Roggio, Al Qaeda announces death of Atiyah Abd al Rahman, The Long War Journal, December 1, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/12/al_qaeda_announces_d.php.

¹⁷⁶ Express Tribune (5 people killed); AFP/Dawn (4 militants killed); AFP/The Nation (3-4 suspected militants killed); All Voices (wrong link); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); Reuters (3 suspected militants killed); Dawn (7 people killed); Daily Times (4 alleged terrorists killed); Yahoo News (link broken); New York Times; Daily Mail; The News (5 men killed); Reuters/Al Jazeera (al-Rahman and 4

The New America Foundation cites 7 sources¹⁷⁷ and states that 4-5 militants were killed. New America also cites a range of other sources for the claim that al-Rahman may have been killed. While noting these reports, New America does not count his death under militant leaders killed.

The Long War Journal cites AFP and states that 4 militants were killed.¹⁷⁸ As noted above, it discusses the alleged death of al-Rahman in a separate article.

Range of reported dead: 3-7

BIJ: 4-7 total, 0-4 civilians

NAF: 4-5 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, US officials, tribal sources, local villagers.

Conclusion: 4-7 total killed, medium identification of 3-5 militants killed, strong identification of 1 named militant killed, 0-4 civilians killed. In our view, early reports of only 3 militants are superseded by later reports. The identification of some of those killed as militants is supported by multiple sources, and circumstantially by the fact that Al-Rahman may have been killed on this day. We count Al-Rahman as one of the named and confirmed dead in this strike, although he may have been killed in a following strike. The Dawn report provides additional identifying information about the civilians reportedly killed, however as it is the only source for this claim, we take a lower figure of 0.

56. August 22 2011

Khaisoori, North Waziristan

Citing tribal sources and local villagers, The News is the sole source which states that there were two separate strikes on August 22. In addition to the strike in Norwak, The News states that an attack in Khaisoori killed an Arab family – 3 men, 2 children, and 1 woman. Tribesmen speculated that if Al-Rahman had been killed it probably would have been in this strike. The News notes that “Interestingly, this attack was not reported in the media.”

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism states that 0-6 people were killed, including 0-3 civilians. New America makes a note of this report and the possibility of a second strike, however it provides no separate count for the strike. The Long War Journal does not cover this alleged strike.

Range of reported dead: 6

BIJ: 0-6 total, 0-3 civilians

NAF: 0

militant followers); DW; Wall Street Journal; AP/ABC (link broken); Washington Post (5 people killed); The Guardian; LA Times; Daily Beast; Wired.

¹⁷⁷ CNN (as above); Daily Times (as above); Dawn (as above); Express Tribune (as above); The News (11 killed in two strikes); AFP (as above); BBC.

¹⁷⁸ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 4 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, August 22, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/08/us_predators_kill_4_8.php.

LWJ: 0

Sources: tribal sources, local villagers.

Conclusion: 0-6 total killed, 0-3 civilians. While there is some identifying information, as there is a single news source we take a lower figure of 0.

57. September 4 2011

Unspecified location in North Waziristan

One day after the end of the Eid holiday at the end of Ramadan, a late night US drone strike somewhere in North Waziristan killed up to 7 alleged militants, according to a TV station cited by BIJ. No specific target is identified, and neither the New America Foundation nor the Long War Journal count the strike at all. The Bureau counts it only as a potential drone strike and does not include the strike in its final count.

58. September 11 2011

Hisokhel village, North Waziristan

A strike by four drones in Hisokhel reportedly destroyed a pick-up truck and damaged a house. The BBC immediately named Hafeezullah, a local Haqqani Network commander, as among the dead, along with an unidentified ‘foreigner’ who may be the same person as Mohammad al-Faateh, a German whom CNN claims was killed, in an article published on October 5. Citing anonymous Pakistani officials, CNN noted that al-Faateh was commander of Harkat-ul-Jihad-al-Islami (HuJI), in contrast to New America’s claim that the target was al-Qaeda. According to the Bureau, German-language source Die Welt, on October 6, made a similar claim that the foreigner was a Berliner named Fatih T.

On September 15, multiple sources including CNN, The Guardian, Voice of America, Reuters, and the New York Times quoted US officials as reporting that Abu Hafs al-Shahri, rumored to be al-Qaeda’s operational chief in Pakistan, had been killed, presumably in this strike. Sources are divided about whether the US officials who reported al-Shahri’s death stated that he died in a drone attack (Reuters, The Guardian) or failed entirely to provide information about the circumstances of his death (CNN, Washington Post). None of these sources confirm that he died in the September 11 strike specifically, and none mention or confirm the death of Hafeezullah or the “foreigner” later identified as al-Faateh.

Only the Bureau gives credence to all of the identifications. New America mentions only al-Shahri as a militant leader killed in the strike, while the Long War Journal acknowledges Hafeezullah and a foreigner as among the dead and later confirms al-Shahri’s death.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 23 sources¹⁷⁹ and gives a death toll of 4-5. Original low reports of “at least two” suspected militants by the BBC, reported early on September 12

¹⁷⁹ BBC (at least two dead), AFP (at least four killed), The News (5 killed), Express Tribune (At least four killed), Nine News (at least four killed), UPI (At least three killed), Antiwar.com (at least five killed), Voice of America (at least three people killed), CNN (3 killed), GeoTV (At least four killed), Washington Post (4 killed), Radio Free Europe (at least three killed), New York Times, Reuters, Voice of America (at

2011, are excluded. It discounts reports of 3 dead from CNN, United Press International (UPI), Voice of America, and Radio Free Europe. One of these, Radio Free Europe, is dated September 16, though it appears to be relying on earlier reports for its death toll.

The New America Foundation, relying on 7 sources,¹⁸⁰ lists 2-4 militants killed.

The Long War Journal¹⁸¹ states “four ‘militants’” were killed and cites AFP (no link provided), and BBC. It notes that the original sources were “Pakistani intelligence officials.” Like the Bureau, the Journal discards BBC’s lower figure but does repeat its identification of Hafeezullah and a “foreigner.” A second Journal report, four days later, reports that US officials later identified one of the dead as al-Shahri.¹⁸² This was confirmed by a statement from al-Shahri’s mother published in Al Hayat Online.¹⁸³ The Journal disputes whether al-Shahri was, as US officials claimed, the head of al Qaeda’s operations in Pakistan, noting that the Asia Times and pro-Taliban newspaper Karachi Islam had reported that a different leader had been appointed in that area.

Range of reported dead: 2-5 total

BIJ: 4-5 total

NAF: 2-4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials; villagers/locals; anonymous US officials (identification of al-Shahri).

Conclusion: 3-5 total killed. One named militant confirmed dead (al-Shahri), 2 named but unconfirmed (Hafeezullah and Mohammad al-Faateh). Apart from those named individuals, the only source identifying the other 0-2 people killed is anonymous officials. As such, their identification as militants is weak. We throw out the lower figure of 2 killed, which is superseded by later reports. While it appears that the lower figure of 3 may also have been superseded, we conservatively take this as our lower figure.

59. September 23 2011

Khushali Khel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly also hit a vehicle and a house. The Express Tribune reports that the house belonged to local tribal leader Jamal Wazir. Four “foreigners” of “Central Asian origin” were

least three killed), BBC, AFP (link outdated), CNN (3 killed), Long War Journal, The Guardian, AP, CNN (3 killed), Die Welt (German language)

¹⁸⁰ New York Times (as above), Telegraph (“at least four”), Express Tribune (“at least three”), Daily Times (“at least four”), CNN (3), Dawn (3), and BBC (“at least two”).

¹⁸¹ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 4 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan strike, Long War Journal, September 11, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/09/us_predators_kill_4_9.php

¹⁸² Bill Roggio, Al Qaeda’s operations chief for Pakistan reported killed in Predator strike, Long War Journal, September 15, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/09/al_qaedas_ops_chief.php.

¹⁸³ Bill Roggio, Abu Hafs al Shahri confirmed killed in Predator strike in Pakistan, The Long War Journal, September 17, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/09/abu_hafs_al_shahri_c.php.

killed in the blast, according to a Peshawar-based security official quoted by AFP. Dawn reports that some Pakistani intelligence officials claimed the dead were ‘all local Taliban militants,’ but also quoted a Miramshah-based intelligence official as reporting that foreigners were thought to be among the dead.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists 3-8 killed, relying on 8 sources.¹⁸⁴ The New America Foundation states 3-6 militants were killed, relying on 5 sources.¹⁸⁵ The Long War Journal¹⁸⁶ states that 6 militants were killed, relying on AFP. It goes on to speculate that the foreigners may be members of the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan or the Turkistan Islamic Party.

Range of reported dead: 3-8

BIJ: 3-8 total

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3 to 8 militants killed; all reports are from anonymous officials. The Express Tribune provides specific information regarding the ownership of the house by tribal leader Jamal Wazir, and those killed are further identified by the claim that they were foreigners from Central Asia, although this conflicts with other reports that they were all local Taliban.

60. September 27 2011

Azam Warsak, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a compound or a vehicle parked in a compound near Wana. Although initial reports count 4 casualties, a later report by AFP quotes a security official who said the militants escaped before the missiles hit their target. Dawn, in a report published the next day (September 28), describes the strike as targeting a house and killing three people, even though it acknowledges that AFP’s version of the strike involved the militants fleeing from a targeted vehicle. A commander named Haleem Ullah was reportedly among these escapees, according to an AFP report on September 30 2011.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism gives a count of 0-4 total killed, relying on 7 sources.¹⁸⁷ The New America Foundation cites 4 sources,¹⁸⁸ and lists 0-4 militants killed. The Long War

¹⁸⁴ AFP (“at least six”), CNN (3), The News (5), Deutsche Presse-Agentur (4), BNO News (“at least five”), Express Tribune (5), Xinhua (“at least eight”), and Dawn (“at least three”)

¹⁸⁵ CNN (3), Express Tribune (5), The News (5), Daily Times (4), AFP (“at least six”).

¹⁸⁶ Bill Roggio, “US Predators kill 6 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan strike,” Long War Journal, September 23, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/09/us_predators_kill_6_6.php

¹⁸⁷ Express Tribune (“at least four”), Xinhua (“At least four”), Pakistan Today (“At least two”), AP (hyperlink outdated), CNN (2), AFP (0), and Dawn (3).

¹⁸⁸ AFP (0); Dawn (“at least three”); Express Tribune (at least four people killed); CNN (as above).

Journal states a death toll of 3, relying on AP, but also notes that AFP claims the militants had escaped the strike.¹⁸⁹

Range of reported dead: 0-4

BIJ: 0-4 total

NAF: 0-4 militants.

LWJ: 0-3 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, Express Tribune's "correspondent"

Conclusion: Weak claim of 0-4 militants killed, relying only on anonymous officials. Express Tribune identifies them as "Taliban belonging to the Nazir group," but cites only its "correspondent" and does not mention original sources. Confusingly, AFP's report that the militants escaped the vehicle is contradicted by reports that instead identify a house as the target.

61. September 30 2011

Baghar, South Waziristan

Several sources purport to identify the victims of this attack on a vehicle. AFP reports that the victims are Pakistani Taliban members, while an official who spoke to Express Tribune stated that the three victims were "not locals." AFP quotes one Pakistani official as saying that Haleem Ullah, deputy to Nazir, was killed in this strike after having escaped the strike three days before. Dawn also names the other two victims as Haji Karam and Kharh. The Hindustan Times, quoting Taliban sources, and the Pakistan Observer also report Haleem Ullah's death, although the latter adds that "High officials when contacted, though confirmed the drone attack and killing of alleged militants, remained tight lipped about the killing of Commander Halimullah and comrades."

Dawn gave further details about the strike, stating that it occurred near an ancestral graveyard, and confirming that the victims were militants: "Sources in intelligence agencies, political administration and witnesses confirmed the death of three militants, including top commander Aleemullah, a close associate of Maulvi Nazir. He was said to be the fourth on the seniority list of commanders of the Nazir group."

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism gives a count of 3-4 total, relying on 14 sources.¹⁹⁰ The New America Foundation relies on 5 sources to report a count of 3-4 militant deaths.¹⁹¹ The Long War Journal¹⁹² cites AFP to say that 3 "militants" were killed. The Journal's entry states

¹⁸⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 3 'militants' in South Waziristan, Long War Journal, September 27, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/09/us_predators_kill_3_1.php.

¹⁹⁰ Pakistan Today (3), AFP (3), AP (link broken), Voice of America (3), Dawn (3), The Nation ("At least four"), CNN (3), Long War Journal (3), Express Tribune (3), SANA (link broken), Dawn (3), Pakistan Observer ("at least three"), The Nation ("At least three"), Hindustan Times (4).

¹⁹¹ Express Tribune (3); CNN (3); AFP (3); Dawn (3 fighters killed); The News (4 suspected militants killed).

¹⁹² Bill Roggio, "US Predators strike again in South Waziristan," Long War Journal, September 30, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/09/us_predators_strike_31.php

that the target of the strike is unknown, and that no senior Taliban or al Qaeda operatives were reported killed in the strike. The Journal reports Haleem Ullah's death in a later article.¹⁹³

Range of reported dead: 3-4 total; 0 civilians

BIJ: 3-4 total killed

NAF: 3-4 militants

LWJ: 3 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, witnesses, anonymous Taliban (identification of Haleem Ullah)

Conclusion: 3 militants are identified strongly by name, the death of one (Haleem Ullah) we treat as confirmed. Up to 1 further person, identified by anonymous officials as a militant, may have been killed. AFP further identifies the victims as "Pakistanis who fought under a nebulous Taliban umbrella, on behalf of Pakistani warlord Maulvi Nazir, whose fighters are allied to the Haqqanis and active in the 10-year war in Afghanistan."

62. October 13 2011

Dande Darpakhel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly killed high level Haqqani Network commander Janbaz Zadran, also known as Jalil/Jamil. Some reports quote Pakistani officials as stating that while Jalil/Jamil was a member of the Network, he was not related to the Haqqanis. US and other Pakistani officials did however confirm Zadran's death, and the Washington Post reported that "One official said the apparent confusion may have arisen because Zadran was sometimes known as "Jamil"." A US official also told the Long War Journal that Zadran and Jamil are the same person. The Washington Post reported that a militant named Maulana Iftikhar was killed, and Foreign Policy reported on Iftikhar's funeral.

Tribesmen told Pakistan Today that the dead included some foreigners. The News notes that "An earlier report said a vehicle was hit in the missile strike and Afghan refugees were killed in the attack. However subsequent reports said a house was struck and four men including Jalil Haqqani were killed." A number of reports said the other people killed were members of the Haqqani network, and some described them as Zadran's guards.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 16 news sources¹⁹⁴ and states that 4-6 people in total were killed, including Zadran and Iftikhar. The New America Foundation cites 5 news sources¹⁹⁵ and states that 4 militants were killed, including 1 militant leader Janbaz Zadran. The

¹⁹³ Bill Roggio, 'Good' Pakistani Taliban commander killed in US Predator strike, The Long War Journal, October 2, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/good_pakistani_talib_2.php.

¹⁹⁴ AFP (4 people killed); CNN (3 militants killed); Dawn (3 militants killed); AP/The Australian (4 militants killed); KUNA (6 suspected militants killed); Times Live (5 militants killed); Washington Post (3 militants killed); Al Jazeera (4 militants killed); BBC (4 suspected militants killed); Reuters (4 militants killed); New York Times (4 militants killed); Pakistan Today (4 people killed); The News (4 people killed); Foreign Policy; Washington Post (3 militants killed); Washington Post. Additional links to Newsday and Washington Post are acknowledged as broken.

¹⁹⁵ LA Times (4 militants killed); AFP (4 militants killed); Al Jazeera (at least 4 people killed); BBC (as above); New York Times (as above).

Long War Journal cites AFP and AP and states that 3 militants including Zadrán were killed. The Journal describes Zadrán as the Haqqani Network's third in command.¹⁹⁶ Citing Dawn, the Long War Journal later named 2 individuals who died with Zadrán as Maulana Iftikhar and Noor Ali Shah.¹⁹⁷

Range of reported dead: 3-6

BIJ: 4-6 total

NAF: 4 militants total; 1 militant leader

LWJ: 3 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, anonymous US officials, tribesmen

Conclusion: 3-6 militants reported killed, strong identification of 2 named and confirmed militants and 1 named but unconfirmed militant. Medium identification of additional 0-3 militants. Only sources explicitly identifying the others killed as militants is anonymous officials, but they are identified as members of the Haqqani Network, and some as foreigners according to tribesmen.

63. October 13 2011

Birmal, South Waziristan

The second strike of the day reportedly hit a house or compound. AFP reports that those killed were militants loyal to Maulvi Nazir, while The News reports that 4 of the dead had links to Nazir and 2 were from Afghanistan. Officials cited by CNN stated that the targeted compound was used by militants to fire missiles at NATO and Afghan National Army forces across the border.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 7 news sources¹⁹⁸ and states that 3-6 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 5 news sources¹⁹⁹ and states that 3-6 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites Dawn and states that 3 militants were killed.²⁰⁰

Range of reported dead: 3-6

BIJ: 3-6 total

¹⁹⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 6 'militants' in North and South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 13, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_kill_4_10.php; Bill Roggio, US kills Haqqani Network's 3rd in command in North Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal, October 13, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_kills_haqqani_net.php.

¹⁹⁷ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 14, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_strike_32.php/.

¹⁹⁸ Al Jazeera (3 people killed); CNN (3 suspected militants killed); Reuters (6 militants killed); AFP (6 militants killed); New York Times (3 people killed); Pakistan Today (4 militants killed); The News (6 people killed).

¹⁹⁹ LA Times (3 suspected militants killed); AFP (6 militants killed); Al Jazeera (at least 3 people killed); BBC (at least 6 suspected militants killed); New York Times (as above).

²⁰⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 6 'militants' in North and South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 13, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_kill_4_10.php.

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 3 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources

Conclusion: Medium identification of 3-6 militants killed. Anonymous officials and tribal sources reportedly identify those killed as militants, who are further identified by their alleged link to Maulvi Nazir. The target is also identified as a compound allegedly responsible for launching attacks into Afghanistan.

64. October 14 2011

Dande Darpakhel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle. Reuters reports that Ahmed Omar Abdul Rahman, the son of Sheikh Omar Abdel Rahman, was killed in this strike. However other reports state that Rahman was killed in Afghanistan. Reuters cites an Afghan Taliban commander as saying that the Sheikh's grandson and another Egyptian were also killed in the attack in North Waziristan. Pakistani officials could not confirm the identities of those killed but said that they were Arabs.

In April 2012 the Long War Journal reported that Abu Miqdad al Masri and his two sons, Al Miqdad Rafie Mustafa and Khalid Rafie Mustafa, had been killed in the strike. The Washington Post earlier cited US officials as stating that al Masri was killed in a strike around this time. A statement by al-Masri's widow was released by al-Qaeda linked Al Fajr Media Center announcing the death of her husband and sons, describing her sons as "like a flower in the arena of jihad." Al Masri was reportedly a member of Al-Qaeda's Shura Majlis, or Executive Council.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 13 sources²⁰¹ and states that 5-6 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 6 sources²⁰² and states that 3-4 people were killed, including 1-2 militants and 2 unknowns. The unknown count results from reports that that the son and grandson (both adults) of radical cleric Sheikh Omar Abdel Rahman were killed. New America states that "It is not clear whether or not they were militants." However the reports state that all of the deceased were militants, and a Reuters article cited by New America cites a Taliban commander as saying that Rahman's son had been encouraging the Pakistani Taliban to join the Afghan Taliban's fight against NATO. New America does not account for al-Masri's alleged death.

The Long War Journal cites AFP and states that 4 militants were killed.²⁰³ The Journal later reported the death of al-Masri and his two sons.²⁰⁴

²⁰¹ AFP/Express Tribune (4 militants killed); AFP/Dawn (4 militants killed); Radio Free Europe (at least 4 militants killed); AP/Huffington Post (4 people killed); AP/Fox News (4 people killed); AFP; The News (3-4 people killed); The Nation (at least 4 militants killed); NBC; Reuters (3 militants killed); Washington Post; Long War Journal, Long War Journal. Links to AP/Newsday and AP are acknowledged as broken.

²⁰² Washington Post (4 people killed); AP (4 people killed); Dawn/AFP (as above); Express Tribune (4 militants killed); The News (3 people killed); Reuters (as above).

²⁰³ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike again in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 14, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_strike_32.php/.

²⁰⁴ Bill Roggio, Death of al Qaeda Shura member confirmed by widow, The Long War Journal, April 23, 2012, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2012/04/death_of_al_qaeda_sh.php. See also:

Range of reported dead: 3-4

BIJ: 5-6 total

NAF: 3-4 total, 1-2 militants, 2 unknown

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, anonymous US officials, anonymous Afghan Taliban commander, villagers

Conclusion: Total 3-6 killed. Strong identification of 3 named militant dead. The militants are named by an immediate family member and the statement released by an Al-Qaeda linked media organization. The statement is consistent with US official reports that al-Masri was killed. Up to 3 other militants may have been killed, identified as Ahmed Omar Abdul Rahman, a relative, and another Egyptian, according to an Afghan Taliban commander. This is also consistent with anonymous official claims that those killed were Arabs. This is unclear however, as conflicting reports state Rahman was killed in Afghanistan. This gives a minimum number of 3 killed and a maximum number of 6.

65. October 15 2011

Angor Adda, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit the suspected hideout of militants loyal to Maulvi Nazir, according to Reuters. Dawn and The News also report that those killed were militants loyal to Nazir.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 7 news sources²⁰⁵ and states that 3-6 people were killed. The New America Foundation cites 6 news sources²⁰⁶ and states that 3-6 militants were killed. The Long War Journal cites Xinhua and Geo TV and states that 4 Taliban fighters loyal to Maulvi Nazir were killed.²⁰⁷

Range of reported dead: 3-6

BIJ: 3-6 total

NAF: 3-6 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, local residents

Bill Roggio, 2 senior al Qaeda leaders killed in recent drone strikes in Pakistan, The Long War Journal, October 28, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/two_senior_al_qaeda_1.php.

²⁰⁵ Dawn (6 suspected militants killed); AFP (4 rebels killed); Press TV (at least 5 people killed); The News (3 people killed); CNN (3 alleged militants killed); Reuters (3 insurgents killed). A link to AP is acknowledged as broken.

²⁰⁶ CNN (as above); Dawn (as above); AFP (as above); Express Tribune (4 rebels killed); The News (as above); Reuters (as above).

²⁰⁷ Bill Roggio, US Predators target 'good Taliban' commander in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 15, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_target_1.php.

Conclusion: Weak identification of 3-6 militants killed. The only source identifying those killed as militants is anonymous officials, and the only additional identifying information provided is an alleged connection to Maulvi Nazir. We take a lower figure of 3 as it is not clear that this figure is superseded by higher counts. However the higher figures may be more accurate in light of reports, including from The News, that others were injured and the death toll was expected to rise.

66. October 15 2011

Baghar Chinah, South Waziristan

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites a single source, South Asian News Agency, for a second strike which allegedly occurred on October 15. The link is now dead, and is acknowledged as such by the Bureau. However according to the Bureau, the report did state that up to 7 alleged militants were killed, and it named three commanders killed as Hazrat Ali, Sher Ali, and Amir Hamza. Neither the New America Foundation nor the Long War Journal appears to cover the strike, and as it is a single source strike, The Bureau does not officially count the strike either.

67. October 26 2011

Bobar, South Waziristan

According to Pakistani officials, this strike killed Taj Gul Mehsud, a senior Taliban close to Hakimullah Mehsud. Mehsud's death was confirmed when a Taliban attack on Pakistan Frontier Corps was claimed to be avenging his death. Officials stated that 13 militants were killed, while tribal elders put the death count at 22, and stated that all of those killed were Taliban. Reuters reports that "Security officials and Taliban sources said the remote location of the suspected strike prevented it from being reported earlier, and reports of the strike only surfaced when the injured arrived at a hospital in Mir Ali."

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 4 sources,²⁰⁸ and states 13-22 total were killed. The New America Foundation had not initially counted the strike, but currently cites 2 sources and states that 13-22 militants were killed.²⁰⁹ The Long War Journal reports Mehsud's death and notes that 13-22 Taliban were reported dead in total, citing Reuters.²¹⁰

Range of reported dead: 13-22

BIJ: 13-22 total

NAF: 13-22 militants

LWJ: 13-22 militants

²⁰⁸ Reuters (13-22 Taliban killed); AP/USA Today; Long War Journal; Long War Journal.

²⁰⁹ Reuters (as above); The News (13-22 Pakistani Taliban).

²¹⁰ Bill Roggio, US Predator strike kills 13 Pakistani Taliban fighters in South Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 28, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predator_strike_k_10.php; Bill Roggio, Taliban avenge death of commander killed in October drone strike, The Long War Journal, December 23, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/12/taliban_avenge_death.php.

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal elders, Pakistani Taliban spokesman Ehsanullah Ehsan (stating that December attack was to avenge Mehsud's death)

Conclusion: 13-22 total killed, Strong identification of 1 named and confirmed militant (Taj Gul Mehsud), medium identification of 12-21 other militants. The others are identified as Taliban by officials and tribal elders.

68. October 27 2011

Azam Warsak, South Waziristan

This strike reportedly killed 4-5 commanders of the Pakistani Taliban faction led by Maulvi Nazir. According to officials and an anonymous commander from Nazir's faction, those killed included Hazrat Omar (Maulvi Nazir's younger brother); Khan Mohammad, Miraj Wazir, and Ashfaq Wazir. AFP reports that the strike "penetrated the close family circle of Maulvi Nazir", and some of the others killed were reportedly relatives. Some reports state that a 5th individual killed was also a commander, others state he was just a militant. The strike reportedly targeted a vehicle, and according to the News:

Sources close to Maulvi Nazeer said the commanders had gone to Angoor Adda near the Afghan border earlier in the morning along with three-dozen militants to fight against the Nato forces in Paktika province. The militants had forgotten something important in Wana, the headquarters of South Waziristan, and decided to go back to Wana and bring the material in the vehicle. The militants were passing through the mountainous Tor Korai area near Azam Warsak when their pickup truck came under attack of the CIA-operated spy planes.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 13 sources²¹¹ and states that 4-6 people were killed, noting the names of 4 Taliban. The New America Foundation cites 6 sources²¹² and states that 4-5 militants were killed, including militant leaders Hazrat Omar, Khan Mohammad, Miraj Wazir and Ashfaq Wazir. The Long War Journal cites Dawn and the New York Times and states that 5 Taliban commanders were killed.²¹³

Range of reported dead: 4-5

BIJ: 4-6 total

NAF: 4-5 militants

LWJ: 5 militants

²¹¹ Dawn (5 Taliban commanders killed); Express Tribune (5 militants killed); AP/Fox News (5 militants killed); AP/Independent (5 people killed); AFP (4 insurgents killed); The News (5 Taliban commanders killed); The Nation (at least 5 militants killed); CNN (5 senior members of Nazir group killed); Washington Post (5 leaders of Pakistani Taliban killed); New York Times (commander and 3 aides killed); China Post (5 Taliban commanders killed); The News (5 senior Pakistani Taliban commanders killed); Dawn.

²¹² Reuters (5 Taliban commanders killed); AFP (as above); Dawn (as above); Express Tribune (as above); CNN (as above); Daily Times (4 militant commanders killed).

²¹³ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 5 Taliban commanders in South Waziristan strike, The Long War Journal October 27, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_kill_fi_1.php.

Sources: anonymous officials, government official Javed Marwat, anonymous Pakistani Taliban commander from the Maulvi Nazir faction, Taliban sources, tribal sources

Conclusion: Strong identification of 4 named militants killed (the death of only one of which appears to be confirmed (Hazrat Omar). Medium identification of additional 0-1 militants killed, supported by multiple sources.

69. October 27 2011

Hisokhel, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a house/compound/hideout. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 3 sources²¹⁴ and states that 4-6 people were killed.

The New America Foundation cites 6 sources²¹⁵ and states that 4-6 militants were killed.

The Long War Journal cites AP, and states that 6 militants were killed.²¹⁶

Range of reported dead: 4-6

BIJ: 4-6 total

NAF: 4-6 militants

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, residents

Conclusion: Weak identification of 4-6 militants killed. The only source for the identification of those killed is anonymous officials, and there is no further identifying information provided.

70. October 30 2011

Datta Khel, North Waziristan

This strike attacked a vehicle, and according to some reports also damaged a house. Officials claimed that all of those killed were militants, however PTI and Dawn report that local people said the deceased were peaceful tribesmen who had nothing to do with militancy. The News reports that four of the deceased were miners travelling from Miramshah to Datta Khel to work in the chromite mines. One of the dead was identified as Saeedur Rahman, a chromite dealer. In March 2012 the New York Times reported that Noor Magul, a farmer from North Waziristan visiting Islamabad, said that three of his relatives – Khastar Gul, Mamrud Khan and Noorzal Khan – were killed in the strike. He “insisted that they had no militant links but worked in a local chromite mine.”

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites 12 sources²¹⁷ and states that 4-6 people were killed, including 4 civilians. The New America Foundation cites 6 sources²¹⁸ and states that 3-6

²¹⁴ Express Tribune (6 militants killed); The News (4 people killed); Dawn (6 tribesmen killed). An additional link to AP is acknowledged as broken.

²¹⁵ Reuters (wrong strike report); AFP (6 militants killed); Dawn (as above); Express Tribune (as above); CNN (4 suspected militants killed); Daily Times (4 militants killed).

²¹⁶ Bill Roggio, US Predators kill 6 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan, The Long War Journal, October 27, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predators_kill_6_7.php.

unknowns were killed (based on the contradicting reports about the identity of the deceased). The Long War Journal cites Xinhua and AFP/Dawn, and states that 6 militants were killed.²¹⁹

Range of reported dead: 4-6

BIJ: 4-6 total, 4 civilians

NAF: 3-6 unknowns

LWJ: 6 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, locals/residents, eyewitnesses, relative of the deceased Noor Magul

Conclusion: 4-6 total killed. 4 civilians are named as killed, weak identification of further 0-2 militants. Although each name is reported only by one source, the identification of those killed as chromite miners is repeated by apparently different sources. In contrast, the identification of the deceased as militants is not supported by any other information and is claimed only by anonymous officials.

71. October 31 2011

Mubarak Shah, North Waziristan

This strike reportedly hit a vehicle and a house. According to officials, all of those killed were suspected militants. However, reports from BBC, PTI, and ABC indicated that two children were killed, 16 year old Tariq Aziz, also known as Tariq Khan, and his cousin Waheed, aged 12. Days before his death, Tariq had attended a Jirga in Islamabad, organized to protest against drone strikes in the tribal areas. The Bureau's own researchers met and photographed Tariq at the event. At a meeting organized by the British charity Reprieve, he had offered to take a camera back with him to document the impact of drone strikes.²²⁰ The Bureau notes that in photos of Waheed displayed at his funeral, he appears to be in his mid-teens. The BBC reports that Tariq's uncle stated the boys were on their way to see a relative when they were killed, and denied that

²¹⁷ AFP (4 militants killed); Al Jazeera (at least 4 people killed); The Nation (at least 6 tribesmen killed); PTI/Hindustan Times (6 suspected militants killed); The News (6 people killed); Dawn (6 people killed); Pak Tribune (6 alleged militants killed); Voice of America (at least 4 militants killed); CNN (4 people killed); Reuters (at least 4 militants killed); The News (4 people killed); New York Times. A link to SANA is acknowledged as broken, and the link to Pak Tribune is repeated.

²¹⁸ Dawn (6 suspected militants killed); Express Tribune (6 people killed); Al Jazeera (as above); AFP (as above); CNN (as above); New York Times (3 civilians killed).

²¹⁹ Bill Roggio, US drones kill 6 'militants' in al Qaeda hub of Datta Khel, The Long War Journal, October 30, 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_drones_killed_6_m.php.

²²⁰ See: Pratap Chatterjee, US ambassador to Pakistan threatened with lawsuit over drone deaths, The Bureau of Investigative Journalism, December 9, 2011, available at <http://www.thebureauinvestigates.com/2011/12/09/u-s-ambassador-to-pakistan-threatened-with-lawsuit-over-drone-deaths/>; Chris Woods, Two boys reported killed in CIA strike, The Bureau of Investigative Journalism, November 2, 2011, available at <http://www.thebureauinvestigates.com/2011/11/02/two-boys-reported-killed-in-cia-strike/>.

Tariq had any link to militant groups, but was “just a normal boy who loved football.” US officials who spoke to AFP affirmed that those killed were militants.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists 14 sources,²²¹ and states a death count of 2-4, including 2 children. The New America Foundation cites 4 sources²²² and states that 2-4 militants were killed. The Long War Journal, citing Samaa and AP, states that this strike on a vehicle killed 4 militants.²²³ Neither New America nor the Long War Journal record the controversy surrounding the two young people who were killed.

Range of reported dead: 2-4

BIJ: 2-4 total, 2 children

NAF: 2-4 militants

LWJ: 4 militants

Sources: anonymous officials, anonymous US officials, tribal sources, villagers, witnesses, Tariq Khan’s family, Tariq Khan’s uncle Noor Kalam, Tariq’s family’s lawyer Mirza Shahzad Akbar (provides a video of the boys’ funeral), anti-drone campaigner Karim Khan

Conclusion: 2-4 total killed. Strong identification of 2 named civilians killed, supported by numerous sources including named family members, and Bureau researchers. In contrast, the claim that Tariq and Waheed were militants is claimed only by anonymous Pakistani and US officials, and no supporting information is provided. Weak identification of 0-2 militants killed, supported only by anonymous officials and with no supporting information provided.

72. November 3 2011

Darpakhel Sarai, North Waziristan

Two drone missiles struck an alleged militant housing compound. Both the Express Tribune and Dawn cite a senior Pakistani security official who stated that at least three militants, loyal to Jamil Haqqani, were killed in the blast. A “local intelligence official” is quoted as saying that 10 militants were inside but that some escaped.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism, citing 7 sources,²²⁴ states 2-3 total were killed.

The New America Foundation had not originally recorded this strike, but currently cites 4 sources and states that 2-3 militants were killed.²²⁵

²²¹ AP/boston.com (4 suspected militants killed); CNN (2 suspected militants killed); Press TV (at least 4 people killed); AP/Dawn (4 suspected militants killed); AFP (link broken); The News (4 people killed); Pak Tribune (3 terrorists killed); IRNA (link broken); PTI/MSN (at least 4 people killed); The Nation; BBC; ABC. Two additional sources are the Bureau’s own articles.

²²² Express Tribune (3 people killed); CNN (as above); AFP (3-4 militants killed); AP/Dawn (as above).

²²³ Bill Roggio, US Predator strike kills 4 ‘militants’ in Mir Ali, The Long War Journal, October 31, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/10/us_predator_strike_k_11.php.

²²⁴ Express Tribune (“at least three militants” killed); Reuters (“at least two militants”); Dawn (“at least three militants”); AP (link broken); Voice of America (“at least two militants”); AFP (link broken); Daily Times (“at least three militants”).

²²⁵ Express Tribune (as above); Reuters (as above); Dawn (as above); Daily Times (as above).

The Long War Journal, relying on Dawn/AFP (“at least three militants” killed) as its only source, states that “Predators killed three Haqqani network fighters in North Waziristan who were loyal to a top leader.”²²⁶

Range of reported dead: 2-3

BIJ: 2-3 total

NAF: 2-3 militants

LWJ: 3 Haqqani network fighters killed.

Sources: anonymous officials

Conclusion: Weak identification of 2-3 militants killed. The only source is anonymous officials, although those killed are identified as militants loyal to Jamil Haqqani.

73. November 15 2011

Miramshah, North Waziristan

After a 12-day pause in drone strikes, a US drone fired two missiles on a house/alleged military compound in the bazaar of Miramshah. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism notes that, while local Pakistani officials claimed that the casualties were alleged militants, “reports could not agree on which group they hailed from,”⁴ with AP and The News naming them as members of the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan, and Reuters, relying on “[s]ecurity officials” based in Miramshah, stating that “those killed were Arabs, believed to be affiliated with al Qaeda.” Other officials, quoted by Dawn, identify those killed as “Punjabi” militants. The Pakistan Observer describes the dead as “tribals.”

The News released two reports relying on different sources (AFP’s Pakistani officials and tribal sources, respectively); giving different figures of 5 and 7. Neither article referenced the other or explicitly stated that the earlier toll had been revised.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism lists “7 total killed,” relying on 15 sources.²²⁷ The New America Foundation gives the total as 6-7 militants, relying on 5 sources.²²⁸

The Long War Journal states that “US Predators killed five people.”²²⁹ It relies on one source, Xinhua. A later report by Xinhua, which the Journal omits, revised the toll to 7.²³⁰

²²⁶ Bill Roggio, “US Predator strike kills 3 Haqqani Network fighters in North Waziristan,” The Long War Journal, 3 November 2011, available at

http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/11/us_predator_strike_k_12.php

²²⁷ AFP (as above); Express Tribune (as above); AP (link broken); Xinhua (“seven” unidentified people); BBC (“at least six suspected militants”); Al Jazeera (as above); CNN (“six suspected militants”); Reuters (“up to seven militants”); SANA (link broken); Dawn (“at least six militants”); The News (as above); The News (“seven persons”); Frontier Post (as above); Pakistan Observer (“up to half a dozen tribals”); The Nation (7 “suspected militants”).

²²⁸ AP (7 alleged militants killed); Al Jazeera (as above); Dawn (as above); CNN (as above); Express Tribune (as above).

²²⁹ Bill Roggio, US Predators strike in Miramshah, The Long War Journal, November 15, 2011, available at http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/11/us_predators_strike_33.php.

Range of reported dead: 3-7

BIJ: 7 total

NAF: 6-7 militants

LWJ: 5 people killed (unclear whether they are included in “militant” count)

Sources: Anonymous officials and tribal sources.

Conclusion: Medium identification of 7 militants killed. The AFP’s earlier number of 3 can be disregarded, since it only appeared once and was reported to be a mistake by the Express Tribune, and Xinhua explicitly revised its original count of 5 to 7.

74. November 16 2011

Babar Ghar, Sararogha, South Waziristan

An early morning strike by five drones attacked two housing compounds reportedly containing local Taliban fighters. The Bureau of Investigative Journalism cites reports as saying that the victims were mostly members of the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan and “foreigners”. The Bureau notes that the two TTP compounds were run by local commanders Abdul Nasir and Abdul Mukhlis. Xinhua refers to local news reports, which apparently stated that two unnamed Taliban leaders were killed in the strike but did not specifically name either of the commanders. The News, while maintaining that the fate of Nasir and Mukhlis remained unknown, mentioned that other reports had claimed that Mukhlis and three other commanders had died in the attack.

The Express Tribune source, quoted by both the Bureau and New America, states that “two fighters of the Tehreek-i-Taliban Pakistan” were among the 16 killed in the strike, but gives no source to specifically support this claim. The article later cites Taliban sources as confirming that there were two militant training centers in the area run by Nasir and Mukhlis, and the Express Tribune may be assuming that the two leaders were both killed in the blast.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism gives a count of 16-22 total killed, relying on 13 sources.²³¹ The New America Foundation²³² counts 12-22 militants killed, citing 7 sources.²³³

²³⁰ See Xiong Tong, ed., “5 killed in U.S. drone strike in NW Pakistan,” Xinhua News, available at http://news.xinhuanet.com/english2010/world/2011-11/15/c_131247503.htm; “7 killed in U.S. drone strike in NW Pakistan,” People’s Daily Online, available at <http://english.peopledaily.com.cn/90777/7645665.html>.

²³¹ AFP (“15 to 18” militants killed); Radio Free Europe (“at least 16” alleged militants); AP/Washington Post (link broken); Express Tribune (“Sixteen people,” but also quotes officials who offer a range from 15 to 18); Xinhua (16); Dawn (“between 15 and 18 militants”); News Tribe (“At least 16”); BBC (“at least 12 suspected militants”); The Nation (“15 to 18 fighters”); Pakistan Today (“eighteen people”); The Hindu (“at least a dozen”); The News (17-22); Frontier Post (“Up to 18.” BIJ’s link redirects to the front page of the Frontier Post; the actual article referenced is available at www.thefrontierpost.com/article/140342/.)

²³² NAF gives the date of this strike as “November 15,” but with the exception of CNN, all of the sources with active links state that the strike occurred on Wednesday, which was November 16. CNN states that the strike occurred on “Tuesday night” but gives a description that matches the Wednesday morning strike reported by the other source.

The Long War Journal states that “18 Taliban fighters” were killed.²³⁴ It relies on one source, Dawn, and seemingly discounts the source’s wider range of possible dead (15 to 18).

Range of reported dead: 12-22

BIJ: 16-22 total

NAF: 12-22 militants

LWJ: 18 Taliban fighters

Sources: anonymous officials, tribal sources, Taliban sources.

Conclusion: Medium identification of 12-22 militants killed. One named militant, Mukhlis, is reported dead, but his death is unconfirmed. Several sources reported that the two targets were run by two identified TTP leaders. Taliban sources also confirmed to the Express Tribune that those individuals operated two training bases in the area. In addition, the officials quoted by AFP identified some of those killed as foreign insurgents.

75. November 17 2011

Shawal, North Waziristan

CIA drones reportedly struck a “compound” in Badamshah village, hitting a room where militants were apparently gathered. Sources were divided on the number killed in the strike, with reports ranging from 4(AFP) to 9 with more expected (News Tribe (UK)).

Channel 4 and The Independent report that British nationals were among the dead. Anonymous officials stated that 4 out of 7 deceased were British. Two were identified by name as Ibrahim Adam and Mohammed Azmir Khan. Taliban sources confirmed the deaths of 7 individuals including British nationals. Family and friends of the two named individuals told the Independent that they believed the two were killed in a drone strike.

The Bureau of Investigative Journalism states 7-9 were killed, relying on 12 sources.²³⁵

The New America Foundation cites 4 sources²³⁶ and states that 4-7 militants were killed. New America had initially not included the strike in its dataset.

The Long War Journal gives a count of “seven ‘militants’” and relies on two sources, AP (“seven alleged militants”) and Geo News (“at least four militants”).²³⁷

²³³ AFP (as above); AP (16 alleged militants killed); Express Tribune (as above); Dawn (15-18 militants killed); BBC (12 suspected militants killed); The News (17-22 militants killed); CNN (18 alleged militants killed).

²³⁴ Bill Roggio, “US Predators kill 18 Taliban fighters in South Waziristan,” The Long War Journal, 16 November 2011, available at www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/11/us_predators_kill_18.php.

²³⁵ AFP (“at least four” people killed); News Tribe (“at least nine people”); AP (link broken); Voice of America (“eight suspected militants”); Long War Journal (“seven ‘militants’”); The Nation (link broken); CNN (“six suspected militants”); Dawn (“seven alleged militants”); SAMAA TV (4-7 killed); Channel 4 News (7 militants killed); The Independent; The News (7 militants killed).

The Bureau also cites to one of its own reports.

²³⁶ AFP (as above); Dawn (as above); CNN (as above); The News (as above).

Range of reported dead: 4-9

BIJ: 7-9 total

NAF: 4-7 militants

LWJ: 7 “militants” killed.

Sources: anonymous officials, Taliban sources, Ibrahim Adam’s father, an anonymous friend of the Azmir Khan family.

Conclusion: Total 7-9 killed. Strong identification of 2 militants who are identified by name. Medium identification of additional 5-7 militants, whose identification by officials is corroborated by Taliban sources. In our view the lower reported figures are superseded. Later reports identifying the British nationals put the figure at 7, which is also confirmed by Taliban sources.

²³⁷ Bill Roggio, “US Predators kill 7 ‘militants’ in North Waziristan,” The Long War Journal, 17 November 2011, available at www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2011/11/us_predators_kill_7_4.php